THE EFFECT OF INSTRUCTION ON THE PERCEIVED DEGREE OF LIKING FOR OPERA IN UPPER ELEMENTARY MUSIC STUDENTS

A Field Report
Presented to
The College of Arts and Sciences
Drake University

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Music Education

by
Penny E. Zaugg
July 1994
The Effect of Instruction on the Perceived Degree of Liking for Opera in Upper Elementary Music Students

by

Penny E. Zaugg

Approved by Committee:

Dr. James Cox, Director

Dr. Carl Staplin

Dr. Ronald Troyer
Dean of the College of Arts and Sciences
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I. <strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for the Study</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of the Study</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Terms</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II. <strong>REVIEW OF LITERATURE</strong></td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preference</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tempo</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timbre</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Styles</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance Medium</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Influences</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listener Characteristics</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performer Characteristics</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vibrato/Timbre</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performer Gender</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult and Peer Influences</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repetition</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Programs</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Activities</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom Instruction</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III. <strong>METHODOLOGY</strong></td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design and Analysis</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measurement Instruments</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Pre-Study Questionnaire</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Response Form</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter IV. RESULTS .................................. 51
Effect of Instruction on Student Degree of Liking
for Opera ........................................... 53
Control Group .................................. 53
Experimental Group .......................... 55
Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental .. 58
Gender Differences and Student Degree of Liking
for Opera ........................................... 60
Male Students Overall ......................... 60
Female Students Overall ..................... 63
Grade Level Differences and Student Degree of Liking
for Opera ........................................... 65
Fourth-Grade Students
Control Group .................................. 65
Experimental Group .......................... 68
Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental .. 70
Fifth-Grade Students
Control Group .................................. 72
Experimental Group .......................... 74
Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental .. 76
Sixth-Grade Students
Control Group .................................. 78
Experimental Group .......................... 80
Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental .. 82
Chapter V. SUMMARY AND DISCUSSION ......................... 86

Summary of Results ............................................ 86
  Effects of Instruction on Student Degree of Liking
  for Opera ..................................................... 87
  Gender Differences and Student Degree of Liking
  for Opera ..................................................... 88
  Grade Level Differences and Student Degree of Liking
  for Opera ..................................................... 88
Discussion ....................................................... 90
  Effects of Instruction on Student Degree of Liking
  for Opera ..................................................... 90
  Gender Differences and Student Degree of Liking
  for Opera ..................................................... 92
  Grade Level Differences and Student Degree of Liking
  for Opera ..................................................... 93
Summary .......................................................... 97
  Recommendations for Further Research .................. 98
  Educational Implications .................................. 100

REFERENCES ..................................................... 102

APPENDICES ..................................................... 116
LIST OF TABLES

1. Control Group Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ....................... 54
2. Paired Sample t-Test: Control Group .................. 55
3. Experimental Group Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ....................... 56
4. Paired Sample t-Test: Experimental Group .................. 57
5. Overall Gain Differences - Control vs. Experimental: Means and Standard Deviations ....................... 58
6. t-Test: Overall Gain Differences - Control vs. Experimental ....................... 60
7. Male Students' Overall Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ....................... 61
8. Paired Sample t-Test: Male Students Overall .................. 62
9. Female Students' Overall Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ....................... 63
10. Paired Sample t-Test: Female Students Overall .................. 64
11. Fourth-Grade Control Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ....................... 66
12. Paired Sample t-Test: Fourth-Grade Control Group .................. 67
13. Fourth-Grade Experimental Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ....................... 68
14. Paired Sample t-Test: Fourth-Grade Experimental Group .................. 70
15. Gain Differences - Fourth-Grade Control vs. Experimental: Means and Standard Deviations .......................... 71

16. Fourth-Grade \( t \)-Test: Control vs. Experimental .................. 72

17. Fifth-Grade Control Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations .......................... 73

18. Paired Sample \( t \)-Test: Fifth-Grade Control Group ............. 74

19. Fifth-Grade Experimental Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ...................... 75

20. Paired Sample \( t \)-Test: Fifth-Grade Experimental Group ....... 76


22. Fifth-Grade \( t \)-Test: Control vs. Experimental ...................... 78

23. Sixth-Grade Control Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations .......................... 79

24. Paired Sample \( t \)-Test: Sixth-Grade Control Group ............. 80

25. Sixth-Grade Experimental Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations ...................... 81

26. Paired Sample \( t \)-Test: Sixth-Grade Experimental Group ...... 82

27. Gain Differences - Sixth-Grade Control vs. Experimental: Means and Standard Deviations .......................... 83

28. Sixth-Grade \( t \)-Test: Control vs. Experimental ...................... 84
THE EFFECT OF INSTRUCTION ON PERCEIVED DEGREE OF LIKING FOR OPERA IN UPPER ELEMENTARY MUSIC STUDENTS

by

Penny E. Zaugg

ABSTRACT

This study examined the effect of instruction on upper elementary music students' degree of liking for opera. Twelve intact music classes were randomly assigned to control and experimental groups. All students were administered a pretest, utilizing a five-point Likert-type scale, to determine initial degree of liking for each musical excerpt. Following the pretest, experimental subjects (n=134) received twelve periods of opera instruction. Control subjects (n=130) received regular music instruction. Following the treatment period, all subjects were administered a posttest.

Statistical t-tests were utilized to investigate significant gain differences (p=.05) between experimental and control groups. Overall, results indicate a significant increase in degree of liking for the Italian and English operas. Analysis by student gender shows no significant gain differences between male and female students. Analysis by grade
levels shows no significant gain differences for fourth-grade students, significant gain differences for the Italian opera with fifth-grade students, and significant gain differences for the English opera with sixth-grade students. Additional research possibilities and educational implications have been included.
Chapter I

INTRODUCTION

Contemporary society requires a systematic method of educating children. Schools fulfill this requirement by providing opportunities for students to develop competencies; educating the younger generation so they can eventually function in society as literate adults. Education in schools also permits knowledge and skills to be passed on, so each generation can learn from the past. Further, schools provide students with a common language and culture while celebrating the diversity within that culture. Therefore, education equips students with the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed to function in society.

Education in music is a comprehensive discipline that encourages students to develop in the psychomotor, cognitive, and affective domains. An effective music program addresses all three domains and provides meaningful experiences so that a student's intellect can be developed to its maximum potential.

Music instruction in the psychomotor domain involves skill development in areas such as singing, moving, listening, and playing instruments. For each of these areas there are various levels of skill
development, ranging from simple to complex.

At a very basic level, a student must perceive music as an aural stimulus. Once this perception has been made, music can then act as a motivating tool which will aid students in becoming mentally, emotionally, and physically prepared to learn. When a student is prepared to learn, music instruction provides students with opportunities for guided responses, trial and error situations, and modeling regarding the skill being addressed.

Subsequent levels in the psychomotor hierarchy provide students an opportunity for more complex skill development. Students do not progress at the same rate through these levels nor do they all achieve every level for a particular skill. However, advancing through these skill development levels is a vital part of a student's education and allows him/her to become physically involved in the learning process.

The cognitive domain describes the process through which students develop conceptual ideas. There are numerous terms, symbols, and facts connected with music education. Students' development of concepts such as high/low, loud/soft, and fast/slow should begin at an early age so that their knowledge serves as a foundation upon which the cognitive domain is built. Demonstrating comprehension of a particular
concept by applying that concept in new situations and analyzing the results illustrates that a student is advancing to more complex cognitive levels. When a student demonstrates an ability to intellectually judge the value of a musical selection, a student has achieved the most complex level in the cognitive domain.

While attention given to the psychomotor and cognitive domains is highly important, the affective domain is critical to music instruction and must not be ignored. The affective domain includes music appreciation, an aesthetic response to a musical stimulus. It is important for music educators to provide meaningful experiences to develop students' appreciation for music. When students are given an opportunity to openly discuss their feelings about a particular musical stimulus, they may be inclined to further explore different avenues of music as their lives progress. Music education not only teaches concepts and skill development, it promotes positive attitudes and encourages intelligent musical value judgments which are important ingredients of a child's learning environment.

Music instruction is an integral part of an effective educational curriculum; therefore, it is important to begin the process at an early age in order to establish a basis for a student's future learning experiences.
Similar to any other academic subject, there is a perceived order of presentation that will provide for a meaningful education. Music instruction must begin at the elementary level and logically progress to more complex levels as students gain musical skills and knowledge.

Elementary music instruction introduces students to many different skills. These skills include singing, listening, movement, and playing instruments. Students begin to develop their singing skills at an early age. Singing is one activity that is readily available to all students, as the human instrument is always carried with them. Singing can be a motivating experience as it can provide opportunities for students to become actively involved in the learning process. Singing can refine students' pitch awareness and aural identification skills. Students may also develop their mapping skills when following the words, left to right, in a song. Correct posture and proper breathing can also be addressed through singing. For these reasons, and more, it is important for singing to be an active component of an elementary music curriculum.

A critical skill necessary for all students is listening. Effective listening involves both hearing and an appropriate understanding of what is being heard. Students begin their listening skill development in all areas by following oral directions. These skills are enhanced in music
through guided listening activities and songs that include oral directions such as standing, moving, or playing instruments at an appropriate time. Music also develops aural discrimination skills through activities that require students to distinguish same or different sounds, high or low pitches, fast or slow rhythms, and loud or soft dynamics, to name a few.

Another appropriate skill to be taught in the elementary music classroom is movement. Simple movement activities develop a student's gross motor skills. As students mature, they may find success by performing more complex movement activities such as conducting or dance. Participating in such activities refines a student's fine motor skills. It is important for a music educator to include gross and fine motor skill development to provide each student with a level of success. Including movement in a music program also provides a means for a student to become physically involved in the learning process, which may build direct student interest in the content being taught.

Similar to movement, the ability to play instruments allows students to achieve a physical interaction with the content being taught. Many rhythm instruments help develop gross motor skills, while instruments such as those used in band and orchestra primarily address fine motor skills. There are many different levels of playing abilities, and
all students can find a level of success with an instrument regardless of their playing ability. When a student has achieved a certain level of success, it may increase his/her desire to participate in future music activities.

In elementary music education, the cognitive domain addresses conceptual development in areas such as rhythm, melody, harmony, form, timbre, and texture. The development of these concepts include terms, symbols, and facts that allow students to establish a tool for an effective interpretation of a musical selection.

Students are exposed to rhythm at an early age through listening exercises and activities that establish a steady beat. Beat groups are introduced as students learn to differentiate between duple and triple meters. As students advance, the level of rhythmic complexity increases to include note names, values, tempi, dynamics, metrical markings, and other staff markings. Learning rhythmic vocabulary and symbols may help a student feel more musically competent and encourage him/her to advance to more complex rhythmic studies.

Another basic element of music is melody. Melodic direction, rhythmic duration, and phrasing are included in the conceptual development of melody. Students begin with the knowledge of such
components and grow to use their applications in creating their own melodies, showing cognitive growth at the synthesis level. As students create their own musical selections, they will also discover relationships between melody and rhythm as these two components are closely related.

The relationship of simultaneous tones is addressed when music instruction includes the element of harmony. Studying harmony may help a student critically analyze a musical selection. Through this analysis, a student can differentiate chord types and gain an understanding of relationships between parts. Students who understand the workings of harmony are more likely to become independent performers when following a specific musical line.

The element of form addresses the order of sections within a musical composition. A basic knowledge of same or different regarding sections helps students determine the overall form of a musical selection. Students may use this knowledge when evaluating the formal structure of complex compositions, such as ternary, rondo, sonata form, or dance suites. Students' understanding of the formal structure of musical selections may increase their interest in music.

Beginning at an early age, students become aware of sounds
around them. Labeling and categorizing these sounds are addressed when studying timbre. From the foundation of knowing different types of voices (speaking, singing, whispering, shouting) and instruments (brass, woodwind, string, percussion, folk, electronic), students may develop skills necessary to discriminate the sounds in a musical selection. Students who understand the concept of timbre and are able to discriminate sounds will likely become more interested musical consumers.

Texture is a musical concept that can be addressed in a natural progression. Students may begin by singing simple, unaccompanied melodies, which can be easily expanded by adding accompaniments or performing the melody as a round. Different melodies may also be added, creating a more diverse texture. Students can enhance their individual musicianship, as well as develop their skills as a group member, through participating in different-textured musical selections.

In addition to the psychomotor and cognitive domains, elementary music instruction must address the affective domain. The affective domain includes aesthetic responses to musical stimuli. Aesthetic responses are as individual as each student. After listening to or performing a musical selection, a student may respond in many ways.
While one student may be moved to tears, another student may sigh with contentment. Whatever the response, it is a description of how a student has been made to feel at that time. Discussing students' responses in music class can prove to be a valuable tool, as it will likely lead to more intelligent musical value judgments.

Elementary music education also includes developing a positive student attitude toward learning. Music education does this by providing many different avenues for students' success. A student who has found success will likely attain a positive attitude towards music. A positive attitude creates a desire for students to continue with musical experiences as music consumers, performers, or observers.

There are many factors that influence student attitude, some of which the music teacher has no control over. However, it is a teacher's responsibility to create a positive climate and atmosphere within his/her classroom as it directly affects students' learning in all three domains. In creating this environment, research suggests that teachers who give more positive responses to students appear to hold their students' attention for longer periods of time. (Greer, Dorow & Hanser, 1973; Jones, 1882; Yarbrough & Price, 1981). Likewise, teachers who emphasize the negative aspects of students' behavior appear to have the
opposite effect on their students (Abeles, Hoffer, and Klotman, 1984). These teachers may also have more student discipline problems and find that students are not willing to attend to the task at hand. Therefore, those teachers dealing with positive reinforcement create an environment that is essential in meeting the needs of their students. Students are more likely to accept new experiences when a positive classroom atmosphere has been established.

The ability to create a positive classroom climate is only one of several characteristics of effective music instructors. Research indicates that teachers who are stimulating, enthusiastic, organized, consistent, assertive, and patient may also positively affect students' learning (Hedden, 1981; Jones, 1992). Stimulating, enthusiastic teachers who are genuinely excited about music and teaching will likely create positive student interest in the material being presented (Cox, 1987). Further, information being presented must also be organized logically and sequentially to hold students' interest.

Music instruction, through a variety of musical styles, can also positively affect student interest. Each student enters music class with a preconceived preference, either positive, negative, or neutral, for a particular musical style. Using a variety of styles increases the likelihood
of including each student's preferred style at some time. Also, using a variety of musical styles can increase a student's tolerance towards styles with which they are unfamiliar or those styles they do not currently prefer. Generally, upper elementary students prefer fast and instrumental selections. (Geringer, 1987; LeBlanc, Colman, McCrary, Sherrill & Malin, 1988; Sims, 1987; Yarbrough, 1987) Therefore, even though a variety of styles should be used, instruction should include, whenever possible, fast instrumental selections as introductions for each style being presented.

Western music includes many of the primary musical styles used in music instruction. It has been a tradition to include western musical styles in a music curriculum to help students learn more about their heritage and history. Many music educators primarily use western musical styles because those musical materials are easily accessible and widely available. When music educators use these musical materials, all musical elements and concepts can be addressed more easily.

Psychomotor skills such as singing, moving, listening, and playing instruments are developed when using western musical styles such as folk, spiritual, blues, country, rock, and classical. Every style has its own
unique melodies, allowing students to sing songs from each style while enabling them to compare and contrast the styles being presented.

Movement activities are studied through authentic dance steps from all genres. Critical listening skills can be developed through many classical musical style selections. Many folk songs provide music instructors with opportunities for students to play and create instrumental parts.

Western musical styles also permit music educators to address all musical elements in the cognitive domain. Loud or soft dynamics, fast or slow tempi, and high or low pitches are elements that can be developed through instruction when using any western musical style.

Along with developing the psychomotor and cognitive domains, western musical styles provide music educators with opportunities to include the affective domain. Openly discussing the reasons why different students may like different western musical style selections in music class addresses students' value judgments and differing attitudes about music. Students who can openly discuss their feelings about music are more apt to become active and interested music consumers.

There are also advantages for including non-western music, that music which does not have a European or North American origin, into an elementary music curriculum. These materials and recordings are
perhaps not as readily available as those for western music; however, using non-western materials will permit a new and exciting examination of musical elements and concepts.

Non-western music provides opportunities for students to improve and expand their skills in several areas. Students seem to enjoy the change from traditional western songs. Early success can be achieved by using English texts, while a more stimulating challenge for more advanced singers can be found using authentic foreign lyrics. Movement is an integral part of many non-western musical styles, and therefore provides added opportunities for a music instructor to include movement activities in a music classroom. Unusual rhythmic activity and unique instrumental timbres in non-western music also provide music students with new opportunities to further develop their aural discrimination skills. Students' playing skills can be enhanced through using non-western musical styles as non-western music is adaptable to instruments found in many music classrooms. Students seem to enjoy experimenting with unique rhythm patterns and timbres provided in non-western music.

Non-western musical materials also promote development in the cognitive domain. Studying non-western music allows a music instructor to address musical elements and concepts common to all styles. Musical
elements such as dynamics, tempo, and pitch are universal components of all music and students deserve an opportunity to study these elements in a variety of musical styles. Studying elements in non-western music may likely provide a window for students to gain a better understanding of cultural diversities in a global society (Norell, 1993).

Instruction in non-western music also permits students to develop a flexible attitude towards music. Students have a favorite musical style which is usually a preconceived idea based only on their past musical experiences. When a music instructor includes non-western music, students become exposed to new experiences. Through exposure alone, students may become receptive to many different styles of music.

NEED FOR THE STUDY

Students will likely develop a deeper understanding and appreciation of music when they are older if a variety of musical styles are used in elementary music instruction. A curriculum incorporating both western and non-western styles naturally include styles not preferred by students. Students sometimes think they do not prefer a particular musical style based upon some preconceived idea, rather than on an actual musical experience.
Sometimes it is not a specific musical style, but an element within that particular style that a student dislikes (LeBlanc, 1981; LeBlanc & Cote, 1983). Students may generalize and think that all country songs are slow because only those country songs that they have heard held a slow tempo. Naturally there are varied tempi within each musical style, but until students possess that knowledge they will continue making generalized decisions that may affect certain musical style preferences.

Another characteristic that students relate to preference is the performing medium of a musical selection. If students dislike a jazz chart performed vocally, they may interpret this as a dislike for jazz when it may actually be a dislike for vocal performance. If students hear the same selection performed instrumentally, research has indicated that students will generally have a higher degree of liking for the selection than when it was performed vocally (LeBlanc, 1981).

Of all the styles students experience, the one that probably many students have experienced the least is opera. There could be several reasons why students may not appreciate opera, one of which may be their unfamiliarity with this art form. Students like what they are familiar with and therefore are familiar with what they like. Peer disapproval for opera may also cause students to think they do not like this style. It is
important for students to be accepted by their peers through commonalities, musical style preference being one of these. Just as peers influence musical style preferences, parents, teachers, and other adult role models may also influence students' liking for opera.

Music instructors can help motivate students to learn more about musical styles through instruction. Through repeated listening activities, students will become more familiar with and may likely increase their liking for a musical style being studied. Using a variety of approaches and activities, students can find a level of success while studying an unfamiliar art form, such as opera. When students are successful in their opera studies, their degree of liking for this style will likely increase.

PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

To provide students with a broad foundation of musical knowledge, it is necessary to include many musical styles in elementary music instruction. Students have many reasons for liking or disliking a certain musical style, such as opera, however instruction may change the way students view a certain musical style. Therefore, the purpose of this study was to determine the effect of instruction on the perceived degree of liking for opera in upper elementary music students.
This study sought to address and answer the following questions:

1. Does instruction have an effect on upper elementary music students' perceived degree of liking for opera?
2. Is there a gain difference between elementary males' and females' perceived degree of liking for opera?
3. Is there a gain difference among fourth-, fifth-, and sixth-grade music students' perceived degree of liking for opera?

DEFINITION OF TERMS

The following definitions will provide clarity and promote a better understanding of selected terms used throughout this study:

1. Opera instruction: operationally defined as a systematic method of providing opera information. Instruction in this study will consist of: providing historical information, presenting the story of each opera, showing appropriate video excerpts of each opera, having students complete written work and perform selected songs from each of the operas studied in class.
2. Regular music instruction: operationally defined as a systematic method of providing musical information, including information from the current textbook series and other materials unrelated to opera studies.

3. Perceived degree of liking: operationally defined as students' perceived feelings about a musical excerpt as measured by their responses on eight, five point Likert-type scales.

4. Upper elementary music students: operationally defined as those students in grades four, five, or six.
Chapter II

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Much research has been conducted regarding student attitude toward specific styles of music. Generally this research can be separated into two major categories: 1) preference for certain music or musical styles and 2) characteristics that influence musical preference. Results of these studies will provide a background that is relevant to the present study.

PREFERENCE

Many studies have examined the types of music elementary students prefer. These studies have primarily addressed the musical elements of tempo and timbre, with several studies also examining the musical styles and performance medium preferred by elementary students.

Tempo

Research has shown that, regardless of listener age or music style, students prefer fast music. LeBlanc and Cote (1983) and LeBlanc
and McCrary (1983) investigated the effects of tempo using traditional jazz compositions. Results indicate a positive correlation between preference and fast tempo for fifth- and sixth-grade students. Even when slower tempo examples had longer playing times, students still marked a significantly higher preference for faster tempo examples.

While results in LeBlanc (1981) also show that fifth-grade student attitudes toward music are affected by tempo, the age at which tempo discriminations are made had not yet been determined. Therefore, Sims (1987) investigated the effects of tempo on preference responses of children in preschool through fourth grade. Results of this study also show a strong, positive correlation between fast tempo and preference for classical piano examples.

Older students also prefer music with fast tempi. LeBlanc, Colman, McCrary, Sherrill, and Malin (1988), Wapnick (1980), Brittin (1991), and Yarbrough (1987), all investigated tempo preferences of college students. Results indicate a statistically significant preference for fast tempi.

**Timbre**

Students show a definite preference for certain vocal and
instrumental timbres. Wapnick (1980) investigated timbral preferences in recorded piano music. Results show that students prefer bright piano timbres. Students, according to Sargon (1993), also prefer popular vocal timbres more than operatic timbres.

**Musical Styles**

A large number of studies have found pop/rock musical styles to be the most preferred by students of varying ages. May (1985) studied primary school-age children's preference for musical styles. Using pictorial scaling tools, a reliable preference measurement for children of this age, students showed a strong liking for current popular music.

Fifth-grade students' preferences were investigated by LeBlanc (1979) and LeBlanc (1981). Findings indicate pop music to be preferred over country, jazz, ragtime, or Dixieland styles. Greer, Dorow, Wachhaus, and White (1973) found rock music to be preferred by fifth-grade students over electronic, jazz, or classical music.

Popular music is also preferred by middle school-aged to college-aged students. Shehan (1985), Baumann (1960), and Palmquist (1988) investigated student style preference and findings consistently show a preference for pop music.
Upper elementary students prefer instrumental performing mediums over vocal ones. LeBlanc and Cote (1983) used traditional jazz selections in a study with fifth- and sixth-grade students. The students consistently preferred instrumental music over vocal music, with no exceptions in preference found for the fourteen classrooms investigated. Likewise, LeBlanc (1981) found elementary students to prefer instrumental examples, even when using a variety of musical styles.

**INFLUENCES**

There are many factors that influence musical preference. Research has included characteristics of the listener(s), musical selections, performer(s), and adult role models or peers. Repetition, the use of educational programs, music activities, and instruction are other factors that research has shown to influence preference.

**Listener Characteristics**

Students in grades kindergarten through third grade show no significant difference in overall music preference with respect to gender.
Shuckert and McDonald (1968) found females' preferences changed twice as often as males' preferences after a three week instruction period; however, no relationship was found between the gender of a student and the direction of the preference shift. May (1983) found no significant difference in music preference between genders, other than excerpts featuring high/low dynamism characteristics. Females preferred low musical dynamism while males, according to May, preferred musical excerpts containing high musical dynamism.

Musical preference may also be influenced by a student's age and/or grade level. Geringer and Madsen (1987) and Brittin (1991) found increasing preference for rock music with advancing grade level. Additionally, results from Greer, Dorow, and Randall (1974) indicate that general music students will increasingly choose to listen to more rock music and less nonrock music with advancing age and/or grade level. By the time students reach the upper elementary grades, there is, according to the authors, an overwhelming preference for rock music. This study also shows a pivotal point appearing between third and fourth grade in terms of musical taste. Upper elementary students also show a higher agreement for song choices as found in Boyle, Hosterman, and Ramsey (1981). Likewise, Rogers (1956) investigated pop music
preference and found more conformity for music preference with increased student age.

There is conflicting evidence with regards to the influence of socioeconomic status on students' music preference. Baumann (1960) investigated the effects of socioeconomic status on teenage students' music preference among popular, folk, and classical music styles. Results indicate a statistically significant difference between preferences of high and low socioeconomic status groups for these kinds of music. The author found those with a high socioeconomic status liked classical excerpts more than the other styles. Rogers (1956) also found a significant difference in preference for classical and popular music between students with differing socioeconomic statuses. Students from upper socioeconomic status homes had a higher preference for classical music than students from low socioeconomic status homes. However, more recently, Williams (1972) found socioeconomic status to have no significant influence on attitude toward popular, folk, chamber, symphonic, or vocal music.
PERFORMER CHARACTERISTICS

Vibrato/Timbre

Students in primary elementary grades through high school have been studied with respect to the influence of a performer's use of vocal vibrato on song literature preference. Using pop, rock, folk, country, bluegrass, disco, jazz, and art music, LeBlanc and Sherrill (1986) found students preferred low amounts of vocal vibrato. More recently, Sargon (1993) investigated students' preference responses to operatic and popular vocal timbres. Results indicate a stronger preference for popular vocal timbres over operatic timbres when hearing either a popular or operatic selection. The strength of group preference for popular timbres, according to the authors, was considerably less for those excerpts drawn from the operatic repertoire, as students apparently recognized that the operatic timbre was more appropriate for the operatic style.

Performer Gender

There appears to be inconsistencies regarding performer gender influences on student music preferences. LeBlanc and Sherrill (1986) found that both male and female listeners preferred male performers over female performers. The authors also found that both genders associated
the perceived strength of performance as stronger for male performers when compared to female performers. Also, the study found that the preference gap between male and female singers was more than twice as large for male listeners as for female listeners. Killian (1988), however, reported that students generally preferred performers of their own gender. Males chose significantly more male-modeled solos as their preference while females chose more female-modeled solos. The author did indicate that females chose solos performed by both genders more often than did males.

ADULT AND PEER INFLUENCES

Many studies have investigated the influence of adult role models on students' musical preference. Crawford (1972) and Dorow (1973) found that students will have an increasingly positive attitude toward music when music is taught under high teacher approval, that is, with a teacher showing a positive attitude toward teaching music. This result was confirmed by Radocy (1976), who reported that students have a perceived need to agree with instructors, even when an instructor provides false information to students. Greer, Dorow, Wachhaus, and White (1973) also studied the influence of teacher behavior on student
music selection behavior. Results indicate that students receiving music lessons under conditions of high adult approval selected more of the music taught than those students taught under adult low-approval conditions.

Greer, Dorow, and Hanser (1973) and Prince (1974) investigated the effect of adult approval on student listening time. Both studies indicate that adult approval is an effective reinforcer on increased listening time for symphonic selections. The authors suggest this occurred due to the association students were given between that musical style and adult approval.

Sims (1986) disagreed with the results of these studies. Data revealed that teacher approval given during listening lessons increased on-task behavior, but did not have an effect on student preferences. This may be due, according to the author, to the short instruction time (four listening lessons) or age of the students (three-to five-year olds).

Wapnick (1976) and Furman and Duke (1988) studied the influence of peers on music preferences. Research in both studies indicated that subjects expressing preferences did in turn affect the preferences of others in the study. The authors also reported that unanimous responses made disagreeing students uncomfortable, but not
uncomfortable enough to make them change their minds for a preference selection. Hedden (1976) also investigated peer influence and found preferences for jazz to be the most susceptible to peer influence while classical music preferences appeared to be well-established negative ones which were generally immune to change.

Tanner (1976) and Alpert (1982) investigated adult and peer influences on student music selection. Research indicates approval reinforcements as influential to students' music selection behavior. Preferences for classical music increased when approval from adults was given, while peer approval influence decreased classical music listening preferences. Other studies addressing both adult and peer influences were Schulten (1987) and LeBlanc (1982). Findings in these studies confirmed the influence factor that adults and peers have on music preference. Personal characteristics of adults and peers may influence an individual to be more or less receptive to different musical styles.

**REPETITION**

One goal of many music educators is to attempt to increase their students' liking of certain kinds of music. Through repeated listening,
repetition is one musical variable that may be manipulated by the teacher. Many studies have researched the influence of repetition of musical examples on preference with students of varying ages. Hedden (1981) observed significant gains in expressed musical preference when repeated listenings with no analytical instruction were used. The author also reported that repeated hearings of a work seem to exert a positive influence on junior high students' affective reactions to the piece being heard. Greer, Dorow, Wachhaus, and White (1973), Moskovitz (1992) and Huebner (1976) also investigated the effects of repetition on student preference, using fast and slow, unfamiliar, serious music excerpts. This research found a significant difference in preference for all style categories used: baroque, classical, romantic, and atonal orchestral mediums. Based on these results, it was possible for the author to make a generalization that repetition did in fact have an effect on children's preference. More recently, Norell (1993) used a series of twenty-two repeated listening experiences of non-western music with upper elementary students. The author found significant gain differences between experimental and control groups toward all styles of non-western music. An analysis by genre indicates that all experimental subjects significantly increased their tolerance toward African and East
Indian styles, with an insignificant gain toward Japanese music.

Using easy listening and avant-garde jazz, Hargreaves (1984) studied familiarity ratings of students. The author found an increase in ratings for both easy listening as well as avant-garde, however the easy listening style was more familiar and liked more overall after each repetition. Similar research was found in Finnas (1989). Results confirmed that preference could be increased by repetitive listening, however preference decreased for simple and well-known music when repetitions were used. Preference did increase for complex music. Prince (1974) found that giving students sufficient exposure to good music will eventually produce a preference in the learner for that music.

Bradley (1971) and Bradley (1972) studied repetitive listening as an important factor in developing positive preferences. Consequently, adequate quantities of repetition should be considered as a useful pedagogical tool in music education. Students themselves seem to realize that repetition can increase preference. Students gave familiarity through repetition as the most often provided reason for their musical preference as studied by Getz (1966).

Familiarity usually comes about through repetition. It is familiarity that plays a part in making transfers of knowledge as found by Yarbrough
Hargreaves and Castell (1987) and Hicken (1992) found familiarity with musical styles was significantly correlated to preferences across a range of musical styles. The fact that an overall familiarity with musical styles is generally a good predictor of preference was also noted by Hicken. Peery and Peery (1986) observed preschool children's preference development to determine if familiarity with a specific musical style (classical), along with a positive social experience, could act as an influence. Results did indicate the experimental group had a significant higher preference for the classical music selections than did the control group.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS

In Patterson (1992), school administrators and music teachers reported that in-school performances are influential and valuable educational experiences for their students. The author also found many active opera outreach programs, as well as an overwhelmingly large number of students experiencing live operatic performances. Sims (1992) investigated the influencing factor of attending an in-school opera performance on upper elementary students' attitudes towards music. Results indicate a positive attitude effect by those that attended a
performance. This study verified earlier results, as the younger students, whether or not in attendance, were more positive than older students who were also in attendance. Overall, the study results seem to indicate that attending a short opera performance may have a positive effect, or at the very worst a neutral effect, on student attitudes toward the opera medium. Fabbrini (1987) introduced opera to teenagers through an in-class performance opportunity. Results show that through performance, students gained familiarity with opera and that such an experience would help to encourage the perpetuation of opera appreciation.

**MUSIC ACTIVITIES**

Concrete experiences in active music making may influence favorable changes in preferences. Shehan (1985) investigated the influence of exposure to an unfamiliar style of music through a variety of song, movement, and listening experiences. Research indicates an increased preference for musical selections when students actively participate in the music making process. Forsythe (1977), Moore (1987), and Yarbrough and Price (1981) studied the relationship of student attentiveness to on-task behavior. Results of these studies show students to be more on-task during activities that require active
participation than during passive activities.

MacGregor (1968) investigated the change in student preference for singing, listening, instrumental and rhythmic activities with a selected group of fourth-grade students. The assumption is that a variety of activities help make the music concepts more meaningful, while at the same time extending the musical interests of the child. A significant difference was observed in females' preferences for music listening while males showed less preference for rhythmic activities on initial and final inventories. Singing preferences were found to be the activity that obtained the greatest mean difference. Instrumental activities were found to be popular for all ages. The author also noted that preferences for certain types of activities may be temporary in nature, but when related to the music program, they can provide necessary motivation for learning musical concepts as well as extending interest to new music activities.

Carlson (1985) specifically addressed the influence of movement activities on student music preference. The author investigated whether movement would affect upper elementary students attitudes toward music when used as an integral part of music instruction. Research shows that movement, when included in instruction as an activity, has a favorable effect on student attitude. Both males and females responded
well to movement as part of their music learning. McCoy and Ellis (1992), used short term instructional strategies to provide movement experiences to students. Like Carlson, research indicates significantly higher posttest scores after actual movement experiences took place.

Singing activities were researched by Baker (1980). Research shows that, like movement, singing positively affects preferences of fourth-grade subjects. The author concluded that performance preference can be affected by appropriate or inappropriate in-class song performances.

Using older students, Prince (1974) investigated whether a guided, analytical listening class would effect students' liking for specific styles of music. Findings suggested that greater liking for a particular musical style did not result in classes where analytical guidance was provided.

CLASSROOM INSTRUCTION

Analyzing musical form and structural elements to help students become more knowledgeable is basic to musical understanding and, eventually musical enjoyment (Bartlett, 1973). One of the author's fundamental concerns of this study was to determine whether greater
awareness of musical structure through instruction would effect a greater liking for music. It was concluded that a teacher should not assume that learning more about musical form and structural elements will transfer to other music, especially if other musical examples contain other elements with a stronger emphasis.

Investigating attitude changes after instruction, Bimberg (1987) found positive results. Most of his subjects showed an increased acceptance of new musical styles. In fact, only a few of those who initially rejected a music selection continued to do so once information for that selection was provided. Bradley (1972) also provided significant evidence in support of the idea that a broader base of musical understanding, through instruction, is valuable in the development of positive preferences, which can lead to the acceptance of new music. The author provided for a broader base of musical understanding through a fourteen week program.

Williams (1972) found that an attitude shift is likely to occur after instruction. Although when this occurs, the author also noted that there is then a similar or contrary shift in attitudes toward other types of music. Music educators are largely responsible for the exposure of students to the variety of music styles present throughout the world. Instruction in
unfamiliar musical styles provides students with a polymusicality and tolerance for approaching other little known genres (Shehan, 1985). Research indicates that instruction emphasizing song and instrumental performances resulted in significant preference increases for the treatment selections.

Flohr (1981) investigated the effect of short-term music instruction on young children's development of music aptitude and instruction on their primary measures of music audiation scores. Results indicate music instruction significantly increasing students' scores. There was however, a slight decrease in mean scores of the control group which suggested the effect of instruction to be only temporary. Likewise, Zimmerman and Sechrest (1970) found that a longer and more intensive instructional period would probably produce more significant effects. Sims (1991) also researched the effect of instruction. Results of this study clearly demonstrate that preschool children are capable of learning to identify and label musical characteristics after a brief program of instruction. This may be partly due to the fact that young children tend to focus on only one aspect of a stimulus at a time.
SUMMARY

Much research has examined musical preferences of elementary students. Research indicates that for all students and for all musical styles there exists a preference for selections with a fast tempo.

Popular music has been found to be the preferred musical style of elementary students. Within this and other styles, instrumental music is preferred over vocal music.

Listener characteristics may effect liking for certain styles of music. There has been no significant difference in preferences with regards to student gender or socioeconomic status. However, a student's age does seem to effect musical preference. Students have an increased preference for pop/rock music as they mature.

Performer characteristics may also influence an elementary student's preference. Such characteristics include vocal vibrato and performer gender. Research shows that students prefer low amounts of vocal vibrato. With regards to performer gender, research shows varying amounts of influence on student musical preference.

Many studies have shown peer and adult role models as influences on students liking for musical styles. A majority of the studies reveal a positive correlation between adult approval and students'
musical preference. Research also indicates peers as having effects on student musical preferences.

Studies indicate repetition of musical examples leads to familiarity with those styles. Familiarity with a certain musical genre will lead to an increased degree of liking for that genre.

Instruction can take many forms. Research indicates changes in students' musical preference through educational programs, music activities, and in class instruction. Opera programs, for example, have been shown to positively influence students' degree of liking for opera. Music activities, including singing, movement, and listening, have all shown a positive influence on students' musical preference. Results show classroom instruction can positively influence students' musical preference. Students' liking for musical styles with initially low approval ratings can be increased through classroom instruction, especially if this instruction includes specific structural elements previously discussed as influential factors.

In keeping with the findings of other studies, the following factors will be observed in this study: 1) Begin opera instruction with examples having a faster tempo. 2) Opera instruction will begin with instrumental examples. 3) This study will investigate musical preferences for opera in
multiple grades. 4) Musical examples used throughout this study will include both male and female performers having similar amounts of vocal vibrato. 5) Instruction will include high amounts of teacher approval. 6) Instruction in opera for this study must include some degree of repetition within that style to significantly increase students' opera preference. 7) This study will use a variety of musical activities during instruction.
Chapter III

METHODOLOGY

The purpose of this study was to determine the effect of instruction on the perceived degree of liking for opera in upper elementary music students. Further, this study investigated gain differences by students’ gender and advancing grade level in perceived degree of liking for opera.

This study addressed and answered the following questions:

1. Does instruction have an effect on upper elementary music students' perceived degree of liking for opera?
2. Is there a difference between elementary males' and females' perceived degree of liking for opera?
3. Is there a difference among fourth-, fifth-, and sixth-grade music students' perceived degree of liking for opera?

Hypotheses for this study, stated in null form, were:

1. There will be no significant effect of instruction ($p = .05$) on upper elementary music students' perceived degree of liking for opera.
2. There will be no significant difference ($p = .05$) between elementary males' and females' perceived degree of liking for opera.

3. There will be no significant difference ($p = .05$) among fourth-, fifth-, and sixth-grade music students' perceived degree of liking for opera.

**DESIGN AND ANALYSIS**

A pretest-posttest equivalent-groups design (Best and Kahn, 1989) was selected to investigate the questions addressed in this study. This design was preferred over others because it allowed gain scores to be easily compared. Other strengths of this design included using randomly assigned groups, separate control and experimental groups, a pretest, and a posttest. The pretest was used to determine students' initial level of liking for opera. After the experimental group received instruction in opera, both groups were given a posttest to measure gain differences in degree of liking.

In addition to those strengths mentioned above, threats to external validity, such as interference of prior treatment and artificiality of the experimental setting, were controlled so that any gain differences can be
generalizable to subjects outside this study. Interference of prior
treatment was controlled in this design by using a control group.
Artificiality of the experimental setting was controlled by the consistency
of teaching styles and approaches used prior to this study.

Paired-sample $t$-tests were utilized to determine differences
between the control and experimental groups in their perceived degree
of liking for opera. Further, paired-sample $t$-tests were used to determine
differences in degree of liking by student gender and advancing grade
level.

MEASUREMENT INSTRUMENTS

Student Pre-Study Questionnaire

This form was used prior to the pretest to determine students'
initial level of liking for opera. The instrument consisted of eight three-
point Likert-type scales including the response choices of agree, unsure,
and disagree (see Appendix A).

Questions on the form included general information with one
specific statement pertaining to listening to or attending operas. Those
students who already preferred opera would participate in the study but
their scores would not be used in the final study. The elementary
guidance counselor administered the pre-study questionnaire to avoid any biasing.

**Student Response Form**

The measurement instrument for this study was a student response form consisting of eight, five-point Likert-type scales ranging from "like very much" to "dislike very much" (see Appendix B). Students were also requested to indicate their grade level and gender by circling the appropriate responses and filling in their student number. The pretest and posttest student response forms were identical except for the color of paper used. The paper color varied to assist in disguising the similarity of the tests. The recorded directions (see Appendix C), one practice example, and completion of the student response form did not exceed twenty-five minutes in length.

**RECORDED MUSICAL EXAMPLES**

**Listening Tape**

A listening tape of six different musical styles including specific opera selections was prepared by the researcher. High quality recordings, tapes, and reproduction equipment were used to reduce the risk of surface noise. The pretest and posttest tape was produced by
dubbing each selection from a commercial recording onto a cassette tape.

This listening tape started with recorded directions and a practice example, followed by eight randomly recorded selections (three opera excerpts and one representative sample from each of the five other musical styles). Each selection was thirty-five seconds in length with fifteen seconds of recorded silence between selections for students to score their responses. A complete list of selections used is presented in Appendix D.

**Musical Style Selection Process**

In order to secure an unbiased, representative sample of musical styles and selections, ten upper elementary music educators were sent a questionnaire to complete (see Appendix E). This questionnaire included a brief synopsis of the procedures relating to this aspect of the study followed by a response section. The response section provided space for five appropriate style categories that students should be exposed to in upper elementary music class. The five styles most frequently submitted were used in this study. Each educator was also asked to provide the names, composers, and artists of two suitable
vocal/instrumental combination compositions for each style that would be unfamiliar to most upper elementary students. The most frequently suggested selections for each style were used. However, if there was not a most frequently suggested selection, a random drawing from those with equal frequencies was made.

**Opera selection process**

In order to secure an unbiased selection of opera examples, voice instructors from five mid-western colleges and universities were contacted and requested to submit the names and composers of five English, five Italian, and five German operas suitable for study by upper elementary music students. This process generated a list of up to twenty-five opera suggestions in each language. This list was then given to ten upper elementary music educators for the purpose of selecting two operas in each language that they felt were appropriate for study in upper elementary grades. The opera in each language most frequently selected by the elementary educators was used for this study.

**SUBJECTS**

The subjects for this study were 264 music students in grades four
through six from two schools in a medium-sized town in central Iowa. Students participating in this study have similar socioeconomic backgrounds as determined by the quantity of free and reduced hot lunches provided in each building.

The two buildings were also shown to be similar with regards to students' initial degree of liking for opera. A Chi square test was performed and results indicate no significant difference between the two schools used for this study.

Of the total sample (n=264), there were 120 male students and 144 female students. There were 82 fourth-grade students (male = 29, female = 53), 95 fifth-grade students (male = 46, female = 49), and 87 sixth-grade students (male = 45, female = 42). The sample primarily consisted of Caucasian students from middle-class families.

PROCEDURES

Upon receiving approval from the Human Subjects Review Board at Drake University, arrangements were made to administer the student pre-study questionnaire. The purpose of the pre-study questionnaire was to determine students' degree of liking for opera at that time. Those students who indicated a liking for opera on the questionnaire
participated in the study, however, their scores were eliminated in the
data analysis. Following the pre-study questionnaire, the pretest and its
tape-recorded listening examples were administered to all music
students in grades four through six in both schools during regular
classroom time. The pretest and its directions did not take more than
twenty-five minutes to complete. Confidentiality of responses was
protected by having an assistant distribute and collect the completed
tests. Confidentiality was demonstrated by utilizing a numerical coding
system instead of requesting student names. Students were only
identified in this study by grade level and gender.

Immediately following the pretest, the experimental group received
twelve class periods of opera instruction. The twelve class periods were
divided into three equal time units of four, thirty minute periods. The
researcher used a varied activity approach for instruction in each opera.
This approach included: giving historical information, presenting story
lines, showing appropriate video sections, having students complete
written work and having students perform certain songs from each of the
operas studied in class. The control group did not receive instruction in
opera, but continued working on regular music curricular studies during
this twelve period instruction time.
Following the experimental group's opera instructional period, both groups received the posttest. This test was identical to the pretest with the exception of paper color. A different color of paper was used for the posttest to help disguise the similarity between tests. The posttest and its recorded directions did not take more than twenty-five minutes to complete.

**TIME OF STUDY**

This study was completed during the 1993-1994 school year. Preliminary writing occurred during the first academic semester with data collection and final editing processes occurring during the Spring 1994 semester. Data was analyzed and reported, and conclusions, along with educational implications, were presented.

**PILOT**

Two third-grade music classes (n = 50) were asked to participate in this aspect of the study. The students in these classes were from one of the two selected schools and were not participating in the final study. The purpose of this pilot study was to determine clarity of recorded directions, student response rate, and the appropriateness of data
analysis. One of the three designated operas (*Amahl and the Night Visitors* -Menotti) was randomly selected and used for instructional purposes. Both classes participated in the pretest and the experimental group then received four class periods of opera instruction. Following the instructional period, both classes received a posttest.

**RESULTS OF THE PILOT**

Two questions arose during the pilot regarding the student pilot response form. First, the instruction "your participation is totally voluntary and you may withdraw whenever you want" was unclear to several students as they wanted to know what the word "withdraw" meant. In an effort to improve clarity of the response sheets, the investigator revised the form used for the study by replacing the word "withdraw" with the word "stop."

Also, the word "undecided" was initially used as a possible response between "agree" and "disagree." When students consistently asked what "undecided" meant, "unsure" was used to replace "undecided" in the study.

It appeared, by completed forms from all students, that there was enough time provided between musical selections for the students to
respond. The same amount of time between examples will be retained and implemented for the actual study.

Means and standard deviations were gathered from the experimental group. The paired-sample t-tests indicated that there was a significant increase in degree of liking for the English opera in the experimental group while the control group showed no significant change in degree of liking. When comparing the experimental and control groups with a statistical t-test, no significant gain differences were realized. These tests also indicated the female students had a significant increase in degree of liking for the English opera, while the male students showed no significant change in their degree of liking.
Chapter IV

RESULTS

The present study investigated the effect of instruction on the perceived degree of liking for opera in upper elementary music students. Further, the study investigated: 1) differences between elementary males' and females' perceived degree of liking for opera, and 2) differences among fourth-, fifth-, and sixth-grade music students' perceived degree of liking for opera.

A pretest-posttest equivalent group experimental design was utilized and subjects in grades four, five, and six were asked to record their degree of liking for all musical style excerpts presented on the listening tape. Only the data pertaining to the three opera examples was included in the data analysis. Following administration of the pretest, the experimental group received 12 opera instructional periods while the control group received regular music instruction. Following the treatment, a posttest was administered to all subjects.

Gain differences were determined by utilizing paired sample t-tests for data analysis. Gain scores were calculated by subtracting the posttest mean from the pretest mean. Since an increase in a student's
degree of liking would result in a smaller numerical response on the posttest, a positive gain difference shows an increase in degree of liking for that musical selection. Statistical t-tests were also used to determine significant differences between the gain scores of students in the control and experimental groups. Students who did not complete both the pretest and posttest were eliminated from data analysis.

The remainder of this chapter is organized in the following format:

I. Effect of instruction on student degree of liking for opera
   a. Control group
   b. Experimental group
   c. Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental

II. Gender differences and student degree of liking for opera
   a. Male students overall
   b. Female students overall

III. Grade level differences and student degree of liking for opera
   a. Fourth-grade students
      1. Control group
      2. Experimental group
      3. Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental
b. Fifth-grade students
   1. Control group
   2. Experimental group
   3. Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental

c. Sixth-grade students
   1. Control group
   2. Experimental group
   3. Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental

Effect of Instruction on Student Degree of Liking for Opera

Control Group

Table 1 displays means and standard deviations for all opera selections. The Italian opera (The Marriage of Figaro-Mozart), yielded a pretest mean score for all control group subjects of 3.6825 and standard deviation of 1.325. The posttest mean score was 3.8413 with a standard deviation of 1.365, resulting in a gain difference of -.1587 and standard deviation of 1.335.

The response of the control group for the German opera (The Magic Flute-Mozart), yielded a pretest mean score of 4.2195 and a standard deviation of 1.251. The posttest mean score was 3.7236 with a standard deviation of 1.559, resulting in a gain difference of .4959 with a
Lastly, the pretest mean score of the control group for the English opera (Amahl and the Night Visitors-Menotti), was 3.8843 with a standard deviation of 1.324. The posttest mean score was 3.4793 and standard deviation was 1.517, resulting in a gain difference of .4050 with a standard deviation of 1.418.

Table 1.
Control Group Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera Type</th>
<th>Pretest</th>
<th>Posttest</th>
<th>Gain Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.6825</td>
<td>1.325</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.8413</td>
<td>1.365</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>-.1587</td>
<td>1.335</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.2195</td>
<td>1.251</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.7236</td>
<td>1.559</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.4959</td>
<td>1.468</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.8843</td>
<td>1.324</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.4793</td>
<td>1.517</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.4050</td>
<td>1.418</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results of the study indicate no significant difference in degree of liking for the Italian opera ($t(125) = -1.33, p = .184$) for the control group. However, results did show a significant increase in degree of liking for the German opera ($t(122) = 3.75, p = .001$). Likewise, results indicate a significant difference in degree of liking for the English opera ($t(120) = 3.14, p = .002$) (see Table 2).

Table 2.
Paired Sample t-Test: Control Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>-1.33</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>.184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>.002 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level

Experimental Group

The means and standard deviations for the experimental group are displayed in Table 3. The pretest mean score for all subjects in the experimental group for the Italian opera was 4.1145 and the standard
deviation was 1.057. The posttest mean score was 3.8779 with a standard deviation of 1.137, resulting in a gain difference of .2366 and standard deviation of 1.252.

Table 3.

Experimental Group Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.1145</td>
<td>1.057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.8779</td>
<td>1.137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.2366</td>
<td>1.252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.2923</td>
<td>.944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.8462</td>
<td>1.260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.4462</td>
<td>1.436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.1953</td>
<td>.981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.1641</td>
<td>1.446</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>1.0313</td>
<td>1.419</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The German opera displayed a pretest mean score for all experimental group subjects as 4.2923 with a .944 standard deviation.
The posttest mean score was 3.8462 and standard deviation of 1.260, resulting in a gain difference of .4462 with a standard deviation of 1.436.

Finally, Table 3 shows the English opera pretest mean score for all subjects in the experimental group as 4.1953 with a standard deviation of .981. The posttest mean score was 3.1641 with a standard deviation of 1.446, resulting in a gain difference of 1.0313 with a standard deviation of 1.419.

Results of the study indicate significant increases in degree of liking for all three opera selections for the experimental group. Paired sample t-tests scores for the Italian opera ($t(130) = 2.16, p = .032$), the German opera ($t(129) = 3.54, p = .001$), and the English opera ($t(127) = 8.22, p = .001$) are shown below in Table 4.

Table 4.
**Paired Sample t-Test: Experimental Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>.032 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>8.22</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level
Gain Differences: Control vs. Experimental

Table 5 displays the gain difference means and standard deviations for the three opera selections. The Italian opera had the control group's mean as -.1587 with a standard deviation of 1.335. The experimental group's mean score was .2366 with a standard deviation of 1.252.

Table 5.
Overall Gain Differences - Control vs. Experimental: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>-.1587</td>
<td>1.335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.2366</td>
<td>1.252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>.4959</td>
<td>1.468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.4462</td>
<td>1.436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>.4050</td>
<td>1.418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>1.0313</td>
<td>1.419</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The control group's mean score for all subjects regarding their liking for the German opera was .4959 with a standard deviation of 1.468. The experimental's mean score was .4462 and the standard deviation was 1.436.

Finally, in Table 5, all control group students displayed a pretest mean score of .4050 and standard deviation of 1.418 for the English opera. The posttest mean score was 1.0313 with a standard deviation of 1.419 for the experimental group students.

Table 6 displays t-test results of the overall gain differences between the control and experimental groups. Results indicate a significant difference between the control and experimental groups' gain differences for the Italian opera (t(255) = 2.45, p = .015). There was no significant difference between the control and experimental groups' gain differences for the German opera (t(251) = .27, p = .785). There was, however, a significant difference between the control and experimental groups' gain differences for the English opera (t(247) = 3.48, p = .001) after the instruction period.
Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>2.45</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>.015 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>-0.27</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level

Table 6 shows a significant difference between the gain scores for the control and experimental groups for the Italian and English operas. Therefore, the first null hypothesis stated in Chapter III, there will be no significant ($p = .05$) effect of instruction on upper elementary music students' perceived degree of liking for opera, was rejected.

Gender Differences and Student Degree of Liking for Opera

Male Students Overall

Table 7 displays the pretest mean score for males as 3.8000 and the standard deviation as 1.332 for the Italian opera. The posttest mean score was 3.9000 with a standard deviation of 1.325, resulting in a gain difference of -0.1000 with a standard deviation of 1.475.
The German opera pretest mean score for males was 4.3866 and the standard deviation was 1.128. The posttest mean score was 3.9076 with a standard deviation of 1.444, resulting in a gain difference of .4790 with a standard deviation of 1.517.

Table 7.

**Male Students’ Overall Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.8000</td>
<td>1.332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.9000</td>
<td>1.325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>-.1000</td>
<td>1.475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.3866</td>
<td>1.128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.9076</td>
<td>1.444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.4790</td>
<td>1.517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.1565</td>
<td>1.189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.3130</td>
<td>1.552</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.8435</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lastly, males responded to the English opera with a pretest mean score of 4.1565 and the standard deviation was 1.189. The posttest mean score was 3.3130 with a standard deviation of 1.552, resulting in a gain difference of .8435 with a standard deviation of 1.519.

Table 8 shows the results of the study, indicating no significant difference in degree of liking for the Italian ($t (119) = -.74, p = .459$) opera. However, there was a significant increase in degree of liking for the German ($t (118) = 3.44, p = .001$) and the English ($t (114) = 5.95, p = .001$) operas.

Table 8.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>-.74</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>.459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>5.95</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level
Female Students Overall

Means and standard deviations for all female students are displayed in Table 9. The Italian opera pretest mean score for females was 3.9927 with a standard deviation of 1.095. The posttest mean score was 3.8248 and the standard deviation was 1.188, resulting in a gain difference of .1679 with a 1.128 standard deviation.

Table 9.
Female Students' Overall Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Italian Opera</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.9927</td>
<td>1.095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.8248</td>
<td>1.188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.1679</td>
<td>1.128</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>German Opera</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.1418</td>
<td>1.070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.6791</td>
<td>1.380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.4627</td>
<td>1.391</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Opera</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.9478</td>
<td>1.146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.3209</td>
<td>1.433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.6269</td>
<td>1.386</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The pretest score for the German opera for female students was 4.1418 with a standard deviation of 1.070. The posttest mean score was 3.6791 and the standard deviation was 1.380, resulting in a gain difference of .4627 with a standard deviation of 1.391.

Pretest scores show females responding to the English opera with a 3.9478 mean and a standard deviation of 1.146, as shown in Table 9. The posttest mean score was 3.3209 and the standard deviation was 1.433, resulting in a gain difference of .6269 with a standard deviation of 1.386.

Table 10.
Paired Sample t-Test: Female Students Overall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>t Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>.084</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>5.24</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the p = .05 level

Female students' paired sample t-test scores are displayed in Table 10. Results of the study indicate no significant difference in degree of liking for the Italian opera (t (136)=1.74, p = .084). However, results for
the German opera \( t\ (133)= 3.85, p=.001 \) and English opera 
\( t\ (133)= 5.24, p=.001 \) indicate a significant increase in females' degree of liking for the two examples.

Results of an analysis of variance indicated no significant main effects for gender. There were also no two-way interactions between gender and experimental condition. Therefore, the second null hypothesis stated in Chapter III, there will be no significant \( (p = .05) \) difference between elementary males' and females' perceived degree of liking for opera fails to be rejected.

**Grade Level Differences and Student Degree of Liking for Opera**

**Fourth-grade Control Group**

Table 11 displays means and standard deviations for all opera selections for the fourth-grade control group. The Italian opera yielded a pretest mean score for fourth-grade control group students of 3.4211 and a standard deviation of 1.244. The posttest mean score was 3.6579 with a standard deviation of 1.258, resulting in a gain difference of -.2368 and a standard deviation of 1.051.

The response of the fourth-grade control group students for the
German opera displayed a pretest mean score of 4.2500 and a standard deviation of 1.079. The posttest mean score was 3.667 with a standard deviation of 1.454, resulting in a gain difference of .5833 and a standard deviation of 1.592.

Table 11.

**Fourth-Grade Control Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.4211</td>
<td>1.244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.6579</td>
<td>1.258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>-.2368</td>
<td>1.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.2500</td>
<td>1.079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.6667</td>
<td>1.454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.5833</td>
<td>1.592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.7429</td>
<td>1.314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.1714</td>
<td>1.524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.5714</td>
<td>1.441</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Finally, the pretest mean score for fourth-grade control group
students for the English opera was 3.7429 with a standard deviation of 1.314. The posttest mean score was 3.1714 with a standard deviation of 1.524, resulting in a gain difference of .5714 and a standard deviation of 1.441.

Results of the study, as indicated in Table 12, revealed no significant difference in degree of liking for the Italian opera ($t(37) = -1.39$, $p = .173$) for the fourth-grade control group. However, there was a significant increase in the degree of liking for the other opera examples. The German opera ($t(35) = 2.20$, $p = .035$) and English opera ($t(34) = 2.35$, $p = .025$) showed a significantly higher degree of liking in fourth-grade control group students.

Table 12.

Paired Sample t-Test: Fourth-Grade Control Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>-1.39</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>.173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>2.20</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>.035 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>2.35</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>.025 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level
Fourth-Grade Experimental Group

The Italian opera displayed a pretest mean score for the fourth-grade experimental group as 4.0750 with a standard deviation of 1.047, as seen in Table 13. The posttest mean score was 4.0250 with a standard deviation of 1.097, resulting in a gain difference of .0500 with a standard deviation of 1.260.

Table 13.
Fourth-Grade Experimental Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.0750</td>
<td>1.047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>4.0250</td>
<td>1.097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.0500</td>
<td>1.260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.2250</td>
<td>.974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.9750</td>
<td>1.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.2500</td>
<td>1.296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.9500</td>
<td>1.085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>2.7250</td>
<td>1.536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>1.2250</td>
<td>1.527</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The German opera showed a pretest mean score for fourth-grade students in the experimental group as 4.2250 and a standard deviation of .974. The posttest mean score was 3.9750 with a standard deviation of 1.209, resulting in a gain difference of .2500 with a standard deviation of 1.296.

Lastly, in Table 13, the English opera yielded a pretest mean score for fourth-grade experimental group students as 3.9500 and a standard deviation of 1.085. The posttest mean score was 2.7250 with a standard deviation of 1.536, resulting in a gain difference of 1.2250 and a standard deviation of 1.527.

Table 14 displays the results of the paired sample t-test for the fourth-grade students in the experimental group. Results indicate no significant difference in degree of liking for the Italian opera ($t(39)= .25, p= .803$) or the German opera ($t(39)= 1.22, p= .230$). Results did indicate a significant difference in degree of liking for the English opera ($t(39)= 5.07, p= .001$).
Table 14.

**Paired Sample t-Test: Fourth-Grade Experimental Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>t Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>.25</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>.803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>.230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>5.07</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the p = .05 level

**Gain Differences: Fourth-Grade Control vs. Experimental**

Table 15 shows the gain mean scores and standard deviations for the control and experimental fourth-grade students. The control group's pretest mean score was -.2368 with a standard deviation of 1.051 and the experimental's mean score was .0500 with a standard deviation of 1.260.

Fourth-grade students in the control group had a pretest mean score of .5833 for the German opera with a standard deviation of 1.592. The experimental group's mean score was .2500 with a standard deviation of 1.296.

Lastly, the English opera showed the control group's mean score
in Table 15 for the fourth-grade students as 0.5714 with a standard deviation of 1.441. The experimental group's mean score was 1.2250 and the standard deviation was 1.527.

Table 15.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>-0.2368</td>
<td>1.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>0.0500</td>
<td>1.260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>0.5833</td>
<td>1.592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>0.2500</td>
<td>1.296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>0.5714</td>
<td>1.441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>1.2250</td>
<td>1.527</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 16 shows the t-test results of the overall gain differences between the control and experimental groups. There is no significant difference for the Italian opera ($t(76) = 1.09, p = 0.280$), the German opera ($t(74) = -1.00, p = 0.318$), or the English opera ($t(73) = 1.90, p = 0.062$) for
fourth-grade students after the instructional period.

Table 16.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>t Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>.280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>-1.00</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>.318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>.062</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fifth-Grade Control Group

Table 17 displays means and standard deviations for all opera selections for the control group of fifth-grade students. The Italian opera yielded a pretest mean score for all fifth-grade control students as 3.4468 with a standard deviation of 1.396. The posttest mean score was 3.6809 and the standard deviation was 1.562, resulting in a gain difference of -.2340 and standard deviation of 1.417.

The pretest score for the German opera was 3.7391 with a standard deviation of 1.452 for the fifth-grade control subjects. The posttest mean score was 3.0000 and standard deviation was 1.700,
resulting in a gain difference of .7391 with a standard deviation of 1.612.

The English opera showed a pretest score of 3.6522 and a standard deviation of 1.449 in Table 17. The posttest mean score was 3.0870 and the standard deviation was 1.631, resulting in a gain difference of .5652 with a standard deviation of 1.515.

Table 17.

Fifth-Grade Control Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera Type</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.4468</td>
<td>1.396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.6809</td>
<td>1.562</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>-.2340</td>
<td>1.417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.7391</td>
<td>1.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.0000</td>
<td>1.700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.7391</td>
<td>1.612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>3.6522</td>
<td>1.449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.0870</td>
<td>1.631</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.5652</td>
<td>1.515</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 18 summarizes the results of the study, with no significant difference in degree of liking for the Italian opera ($t(46) = -1.13, p = .264$). However, results did show a significant increase in degree of liking for the German ($t(45) = 3.11, p = .003$) and English ($t(45) = 2.53, p = .015$) operas.

Table 18.
Paired Sample t-Test: Fifth-Grade Control Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>-1.13</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>.264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>.003 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>2.53</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>.015 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level

Fifth-Grade Experimental Group

The means and standard deviations for the fifth-grade experimental group are displayed in Table 19. The pretest mean score for the Italian opera was 4.0612 with a standard deviation of 1.049. The posttest mean score was 3.5102 and the standard deviation was 1.157, resulting in a gain difference of .5510 with a standard deviation of 1.226.
The German opera displayed a pretest mean score for all fifth-grade experimental group subjects as 4.1020 with a 1.046 standard deviation. The posttest mean score was 3.5102 and the standard deviation was 1.277, resulting in a gain difference of .5918 with a standard deviation of 1.580.

Table 19.
Fifth-Grade Experimental Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.0612</td>
<td>1.049</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.5102</td>
<td>1.157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.5510</td>
<td>1.226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.1020</td>
<td>1.046</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.5102</td>
<td>1.277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.5918</td>
<td>1.580</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.2041</td>
<td>.957</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.2857</td>
<td>1.339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.9184</td>
<td>1.367</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lastly, Table 19 shows the pretest mean score as 4.2041 and the standard deviation as .957 for the English opera. The posttest mean score was 3.2857 with a standard deviation of 1.339, resulting in a gain difference of .9184 with a standard deviation of 1.367.

Table 20 displays the results of the fifth-grade experimental paired sample $t$-test. Results indicate a significant increase in degree of liking for all three opera examples. The Italian ($t (48)=3.15, p=.003$), German ($t (48)=2.26, p=.012$), as well as English ($t (48)=4.70, p=.001$) operas all had a significantly higher degree of liking after the instructional period.

Table 20.  
**Paired Sample $t$-Test: Fifth-Grade Experimental Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>.003 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>2.26</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>.012 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>4.70</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level

**Gain Differences: Fifth-Grade Control vs. Experimental**

Gain mean scores and standard deviations for all fifth-grade students are shown in Table 21. The Italian opera showed the control group's mean score as -.2340 with a standard deviation of 1.417. The
The experimental group's mean score was .5510 with a standard deviation of 1.226.

The control group's mean score for the German opera was .7391 with a standard deviation of 1.612. The mean score of the experimental group was .5918 with a standard deviation of 1.580.

Table 21.

Gain Differences - Fifth-Grade - Control vs. Experimental: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>-.2340</td>
<td>1.417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.5510</td>
<td>1.226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>.7391</td>
<td>1.612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.5918</td>
<td>1.580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>.5652</td>
<td>1.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.9184</td>
<td>1.367</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lastly, the English opera showed the pretest mean score for the fifth-grade control students as .5652 with a standard deviation of 1.515. The experimental group's mean score was .9184 with a standard
deviation of 1.367.

Table 22 shows the paired sample $t$-test scores for all fifth-grade students. Results of the study indicates a significant difference for the Italian opera ($t(94)=2.91, \ p=.005$). There were no significant differences for the German opera ($t(93)=-.45, \ p=.654$), or the English opera ($t(93)=1.19, \ p=.235$).

Table 22.
Fifth-Grade $t$-Test: Control vs. Experimental

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>2.91</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>.005 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>-.45</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>.654</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>.235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level

Sixth-Grade Control Group

Table 23 displays the means and standard deviations for the sixth-grade control students. For the Italian opera, students had a pretest mean score of 4.1951 with a standard deviation of 1.188. The posttest mean score was also 4.1951 with a standard deviation of 1.167, resulting in a gain difference of .0000 and standard deviation of 1.483.
The pretest mean score of sixth-grade control students for the German opera is displayed in Table 23 as 4.7317 with a standard deviation of .923. The posttest mean score was 4.5854 with a standard deviation of .974, resulting in a gain difference of .1463 and standard deviation of 1.108.

Table 23.
Sixth-Grade Control Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italian Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.1951</td>
<td>1.188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>4.1951</td>
<td>1.167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.0000</td>
<td>1.483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>German Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.7317</td>
<td>.923</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>4.5854</td>
<td>.974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.1463</td>
<td>1.108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Opera</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.2750</td>
<td>1.109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>4.2000</td>
<td>1.091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.0750</td>
<td>1.248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Finally, Table 23 shows the pretest mean score for the English opera as 4.2750 with a standard deviation of 1.109. The posttest mean score was 4.2000 and the standard deviation was 1.091, resulting in a gain difference of .0750 with a standard deviation of 1.248.

Sixth-grade control group results of the paired sample t-test are shown in Table 24. The Italian ($t(40) = .00, p = 1.000$), German ($t(40) = .85, p = .403$), and English ($t(39) = .38, p = .706$) operas show no significant increase in degree of liking.

Table 24.
Paired Sample t-Test: Sixth Grade Control Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>t Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>.403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>.38</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sixth-Grade Experimental Group

Table 25 displays the means and standard deviations for the sixth-grade experimental group for all operas. The pretest mean score for the Italian opera was 4.2143 with a standard deviation of 1.094. The mean score of the posttest was 4.1667 and the standard deviation was 1.057,
resulting in a gain difference of .0476 with a standard deviation of 1.229.

The pretest mean score for the German opera, as shown in Table 25, was 4.5854 with a standard deviation of .706 for the sixth-grade experimental group. The posttest mean score was 4.1220 and the standard deviation was 1.229, resulting in a gain difference of .4634 with a 1.398 standard deviation.

Table 25.
Sixth-Grade Experimental Group's Degree of Liking for Opera: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian Opera</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.2143</td>
<td>1.094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>4.1667</td>
<td>1.057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.0476</td>
<td>1.229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German Opera</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.5854</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>4.1220</td>
<td>1.229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.4634</td>
<td>1.398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Opera</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>4.4359</td>
<td>.852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>3.4615</td>
<td>1.411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain Difference</td>
<td>.9744</td>
<td>1.386</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lastly, Table 25 shows the pretest mean score of 4.4359 and standard deviation of .852 for the English opera. The posttest mean score was 3.4615 and the standard deviation was 1.411, resulting in a gain difference of .9744 and a standard deviation of 1.386.

Results indicate no significant increase in degree of liking of sixth-grade experimental subjects in the Italian opera ($t(41) = .25, p = .803$), as displayed in Table 26. A significant increase in degree of liking was found for the German ($t(40) = 2.12, p = .040$), as well as for the English ($t(38) = 4.39, p = .001$) operas.

Table 26.

**Paired Sample t-Test: Sixth Grade Experimental Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>$t$ Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of $t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>.25</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>.803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>.040 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>4.39</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>.001 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the $p = .05$ level

**Gain Differences: Sixth-Grade Control vs. Experimental**

Gain mean scores and standard deviations for the sixth-grade control and experimental groups are displayed in Table 27. The Italian
opera showed the sixth-grade control group's mean score as .0000 with a standard deviation of 1.483. The experimental group's mean score was .0476 with a standard deviation of 1.229.

The control group's mean score for the German opera was .1463 with a standard deviation of 1.108. The mean score of the experimental group was .4634 and the standard deviation was 1.398.

Lastly, the English opera showed the control group's mean score as .0750 with a standard deviation of 1.248. The experimental group's mean score was .9744 with a standard deviation of 1.386.

Table 27. 
Gain Differences - Sixth-Grade Control vs. Experimental: Means and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian Opera</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>.0000</td>
<td>1.483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.0476</td>
<td>1.229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German Opera</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>.1463</td>
<td>1.108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.4634</td>
<td>1.398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Opera</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>.0750</td>
<td>1.248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>.9744</td>
<td>1.386</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results of the study shown in Table 28 are the overall sixth-grade paired sample t-test scores. There were no significant differences between the sixth-grade control and experimental groups' gain differences for the Italian opera (t(81) = -.16, p = .874) or the German opera (t(80) = 1.14, p = .259). There was, however, a significant difference between the control and experimental groups' gain differences for the English opera (t(77) = 3.03, p = .003).

Table 28.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>t Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Significance of t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>.874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>.259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>3.03</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>.003 *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significance at the p = .05 level

Fourth-grade students showed no significant difference in degree of liking for any of the operas. Fifth-grade experimental students did, however, show a significant increase degree of liking for the Italian opera, while the sixth-grade students in the experimental group showed
an increase for the English opera. Therefore, the third null hypothesis
stated in Chapter III, there will be no significant ($p = .05$) difference
among fourth-, fifth-, and sixth-grade music students perceived degree of
liking for opera, is rejected.
Chapter V

SUMMARY AND DISCUSSION

The purpose of the present study was to investigate the effect of instruction on the perceived degree of liking for opera in upper elementary music students. Further, the study investigated:

1) differences between males' and females' perceived degree of liking for opera and 2) differences among fourth-, fifth-, and sixth-grade music students' perceived degree of liking for opera.

SUMMARY OF RESULTS

Upper elementary students from twelve intact music classes were randomly assigned to control (n= 130) and experimental (n= 134) groups. Results consisted of analyzing responses from fourth- (n= 82), fifth- (n= 95), and sixth-grade (n= 87) students.

All students were administered a pretest, utilizing a five-point Likert-type scale, to determine degree of liking for each of the eight tape-recorded (opera = three, non-opera = five) musical excerpts. Although non-opera musical styles were included on the pretest-posttest listening tape, due to the focus of this study, only those responses regarding the
opera selections were included in the data analysis.

Following the pretest, the experimental group received twelve opera instructional periods while the control group received regular music instruction. The posttest was administered to all subjects following the twelve class periods. Students who did not complete both the pretest and posttest were eliminated from data analysis.

Effects of Instruction on Student Degree of Liking for Opera

Mean scores and standard deviations were used to investigate the effect of instruction on students' perceived degree of liking for opera. Paired sample t-tests were utilized to determine significant gain differences between control and experimental groups. Results indicated a significant increase in degree of liking within both groups. The control group significantly increased their degree of liking for the German \( (p = .001) \) and English \( (p = .002) \) operas, while the experimental group significantly increased their degree of liking for all three operas, Italian \( (p = .032) \), German \( (p = .001) \), and English \( (p = .001) \).

Statistical t-tests were utilized to investigate significant differences between the control and experimental groups. Gain scores for the experimental group were significantly higher for the Italian opera
(p = .015) and the English opera (p = .001) than were the control group scores. Therefore, opera instruction appears to positively affect students' degree of liking for opera.

**Gender Differences and Student Degree of Liking for Opera**

Paired sample t-tests were used to investigate significant differences between overall male and female students' degree of liking for opera. A significant gain in degree of liking was realized for male students for the German (p = .001) and English (p = .001) operas. Female students also displayed a significant increase in degree of liking for the German (p = .001) and English (p = .001) operas.

An analysis of variance (ANOVA) was utilized and results yielded no significant main effects for gender. There were also no two-way interactions between gender and experimental condition. Therefore, there appears to be no significant gain difference between overall male and female students' degree of liking for opera.

**Grade Level Differences and Student Degree of Liking for Opera**

Means and standard deviations from paired sample t-tests were
used to determine significant differences among fourth-, fifth-, and sixth-grade students' degree of liking for opera. Results indicate the fourth-grade control group having a significant increase in degree of liking for the German ($p = .035$) and English ($p = .025$) operas, while the experimental group revealed a significant gain ($p = .001$) for the English opera only.

When comparing the results of the statistical $t$-test between the fourth-grade control and experimental groups, no significant gain differences were found. However, the experimental group did show a higher, but not significant, gain difference ($p = .062$) for the English opera.

The fifth-grade control group significantly increased their degree of liking for the German ($p = .003$) and English ($p = .015$) operas, while the experimental group significantly increased their degree of liking for all three opera selections: Italian ($p = .003$), German ($p = .012$), and English ($p = .001$). The statistical $t$-test showed a significantly higher gain difference ($p = .005$) for the Italian opera for the experimental group.

Results showed that the sixth-grade students in the control group had no significant increase in degree of liking for any opera; however, the experimental group displayed a significant increase ($p = .040$) in
degree of liking for the German, as well as the English ($\rho = .001$), operas. When comparing the control and experimental groups with a t-test, the experimental group showed a significantly higher gain difference ($\rho = .003$) for the English opera over the control group.

**DISCUSSION**

**Effects of Instruction on Student Degree of Liking for Opera**

The present study indicates that instruction in opera does appear to have a positive effect on upper elementary music students' degree of liking for opera. This finding is supported in previous research (Bimberg, 1987; Shehan, 1985; Sims, 1991; Zimmerman and Sechrest, 1970) that focused on the effects of instruction on students' musical attitudes.

Overall, control group students did show a significant increase in their degree of liking for the German and English operas, even though they received no opera instruction. There are several explanations as to why this may have occurred. Familiarity, caused by using the same opera examples for both the pretest and posttest, may have positively influenced students' posttest responses. Another possibility may be social interactions between students in the control and experimental
groups which are common for students of this age. Further, if control
group students discovered what was being studied by the experimental
group, they may have altered their responses to reflect what they thought
the researcher was desiring.

The experimental group students increased their degree of liking
for all three operas. When compared to the control group, the
experimental group also showed significantly higher gain differences for
the Italian and English operas. This additional increase may be the
result of the opera instruction that the experimental group received.

Instruction provides repetition, which has been shown by other
researchers (Hedden, 1981; Huebner, 1976; Moskovitz, 1992; Norell,
1993) to significantly increase students' musical interests. Repetition
provides students with a continuing exposure to a specific musical genre,
like opera, which may develop students' awareness and appreciation of
that genre. Through opera instruction, repetition may also facilitate
familiarity with the operatic style. Even though student's initial opera
exposure may be uncertain, additional instruction allows students to
become more comfortable with opera.

Students' degree of liking for excerpts containing lyrics in a foreign
language may well rest upon the amount of familiarity that a student has
with that language. Students become exposed to foreign lyrics when songs, such as those found in the German and Italian operas, are used for instruction. As instruction progresses, students become more familiar with those languages and may accept them more readily.

Further, instruction also allows students to participate in a variety of musical activities, which provide them with opportunities to explore many different aspects of opera. Research has shown that the use of a variety of activities will likely positively effect students' musical interests (Baker, 1980; McCoy & Ellis, 1992; Prince, 1974) and, therefore, possibly create a liking for that style.

**Gender Differences and Student Degree of Liking for Opera**

Males and females both increased their degree of liking for the German and English operas. There appears to be no significant difference in degree of liking between male and female students. Overall, previous research has also shown no clear difference in music preference due to listener gender (May, 1983; Schuckert & McDonald, 1968). One explanation may be the selection of gender neutral music activities used in instruction. Even though research has shown differing activity preferences for males and females (Carlson, 1985; MacGregor,
a wide variety of activities were used in opera instruction. This variety allowed all students to participate in their preferred activity.

Previous research has also found a preference for performer gender (Killian, 1988; LeBlanc & Sherrill, 1986), in that male listeners prefer male performers and female listeners prefer female performers. All three operas contained both male and female performers, as did the opera selections used on the pretest-posttest listening tape. Therefore, performer gender should not have caused a significant difference in degree of liking for opera between male and female students.

Grade Level Differences and Student Degree of Liking for Opera

The fourth-grade students in the control group significantly increased their degree of liking for the German and English operas, although receiving no opera instruction. There may be several explanations for this occurrence. It appears that this age group participates in more social interactions outside of music class than older students. Through such interactions, students are more likely to share their classroom experiences and activities with their peers. Students may realize that different subjects (i.e. opera) were being discussed in
other music classes. Through this realization, students may have given posttest responses they felt the researcher was expecting.

The experimental fourth-grade students increased their degree of liking for all three operas, with a significant increase for the English opera only. Liking for the German opera may not have shown a significant increase as it was the earliest taught opera. Students of this age have a relatively short attention span and would likely show a higher degree of liking for operas taught later in the unit. Lack of significance for the Italian opera may have resulted from the high level of difficulty in the libretto. Video and audio selections of both of these operas also contained foreign lyrics which may have increased the difficulty level for students of this age.

The English opera may have appeared more positive to this group for several reasons. Obviously there was no language barrier to detract from the overall story. The English opera also had a simplistic plot which was relatively easy for all students to follow. Finally, the English opera was taught later in the unit, making it more familiar for the students' responses on the posttest. These factors caused the experimental group to show a higher, but not significant, gain difference for the English opera when compared to the control group.
Fifth-grade students in the control group significantly increased their degree of liking for both the German and English operas. Familiarity, from the pretest-posttest listening experiences, may have been one reason for this increase. Another explanation may be the students' age. Research has shown that older students begin to have specific likes and dislikes for particular musical styles (Boyle, Hosterman, and Ramsey, 1981; Brittin, 1991; Geringer and Madsen, 1987). Fifth-grade students may not yet focus on specific likes and dislikes and may still be receptive to new styles, allowing familiarity through listening experiences to increase their degree of liking on the posttest.

Students in the fifth-grade experimental group significantly increased their degree of liking for all three operas. Initially, students had a positive experience because their first instruction dealt with the English opera. The Italian opera, while difficult for fourth-grade students, seemed to possess a timely challenge when following the English opera in the fifth-grade instruction. The last opera taught to the fifth-grade students was the German opera. This recent familiarity may have positively influenced the students' responses on the posttest.

When comparing students in the fifth-grade control and experimental groups, a significant gain difference was found for the
Italian opera. Further, the experimental group did show a higher, but not significant, gain score for the English opera when compared to the control group. These differences may be a result of instruction.

The sixth-grade control group students showed no significant increase in degree of liking for any of the three opera selections. These students were not exposed to any opera information or musical selections during music instruction. Research indicates a high degree of liking established for the rock styles of music as well as a dislike for non-rock music for sixth-grade students (Brittin, 1991; Greer, Dorow, and Randall, 1974). These predetermined factors are usually highly influenced by peers (Alpert, 1982; Tanner, 1976). Sixth-grade peer influences probably do not include a high degree of liking for opera. Also, by this age, students are not likely to leave their peer group to discuss music activities with other students. This limited interaction probably assisted in keeping the control group uninformed about instruction the experimental group was receiving.

Sixth-grade experimental students showed an increase in degree of liking for all three operas with a significant increase for the German and English operas. Although there was an increase in degree of liking for the Italian opera, it was not significant probably because it was the
first opera used in the instructional period. Following the Italian opera, the repetition of foreign lyrics allowed the German opera to be more readily accepted by the students. The English opera displayed a significant increase in degree of liking, possibly because it was the last opera taught in this unit. Since it contained only English lyrics, it posed no language barriers for these students.

The experimental group possessed a higher gain difference for all three operas when compared to the control group, with a significant gain difference for the English opera. Instruction is likely the explanation for these higher increases.

Summary

The present study indicates that opera instruction positively effects students' degree of liking for opera. Instruction allows students to become familiar with a previously unfamiliar art form, building their level of acceptance for this genre.

The present study also suggests that following instruction there are no significant differences between male and female students' degree of liking for opera. When a variety of activities and materials are utilized for instruction, gender biases do not appear to be present.
Finally, instruction appears to positively effect all grade levels with greatest gain differences realized for older students. Fourth- and fifth-grade students appear to be more open to a variety of musical styles and, initially, had a higher degree of liking for opera than did the sixth-grade students. Therefore, instruction, while increasing the younger students' degree of liking, showed fewer significant gain differences between the control and experimental groups. There were more significant gain differences between the control and experimental groups for the sixth-grade students, as the sixth-grade control group showed a low degree of liking for opera on both the pretest and posttest. The order of introduction of operas, the sophistication level of the libretto, and unfamiliarity of foreign language also appears to have a greater impact on younger students.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

The present study provides several opportunities for future research, some of which include: opera selections, language choices, length of instruction, teaching activities, student grade levels, and other musical styles. Studies investigating these variables may yield interesting results.
Overall gain differences reveal a significant increase in degree of liking for the German and English operas; therefore, it would be interesting to study the effect of instruction on students' perceived degree of liking using different opera selections. Included in future studies might be operas written by different composers or a different combination of composers. These selections might include different stylistic periods and operas with a variety of libretti.

An investigation of language choices of operas may prove interesting. Languages other than Italian, German, or English may be included in a replication of this study. Also, the order in which these languages are taught may produce interesting results in future studies.

Another worthwhile avenue of research might address the time period spent for instruction. Researchers might examine the effect of instruction on perceived degree of liking for opera and spend more than twelve, thirty-minute, class periods divided equally for the three operas.

Further research might also include the replication of the present study by using different teaching approaches and activities. Activities used in instruction for this study include: singing, playing instruments, playing games, listening, and watching videos. Other activities, such as attending opera performances, student-produced opera productions, or
class discussions with touring opera performers, may also be used to effectively increase students' degree of liking for opera in future studies.

A future study including more grade levels may also present meaningful results. It may be beneficial to investigate effects of instruction on seventh- and eighth-grade students' degree of liking for opera. Future studies may reveal that instruction may positively influence older students as well as upper elementary students. Other studies including lower elementary or primary students may also positively contribute to the professional research.

Finally, research investigating genres other than opera may present worthwhile results. Non-western music, western classical music, and vocal jazz also have reputations as being unliked by upper elementary students. Future research may show an increase, after instruction, in degree of liking for these styles.

EDUCATIONAL IMPLICATIONS

Students will likely develop a deeper understanding and appreciation of music when a variety of musical styles are incorporated in their elementary music instruction. A curriculum utilizing many musical styles will likely include styles that are and those that are not preferred by
students.

Through instruction, a student's degree of liking for those styles not naturally preferred may be increased. A variety of activities should be incorporated within instruction to build familiarity with unfamiliar musical styles. If a student's degree of liking for one unfamiliar genre increases through instruction, this may lead to the acceptance of other new musical styles.

Results of this study indicate instruction can increase students' degree of liking for an unfamiliar style, namely opera. It is the responsibility of a music educator to create an environment in which students have a positive attitude towards many styles of music. A music curriculum which includes instruction with unfamiliar materials, (i.e. opera, ballet, world music), will likely succeed in encouraging student acceptance of these styles.
References


*Dissertation Abstracts International, 34* (5), 2157A-2158A.


*Dissertation Abstracts International, 42* (2), 591A-592A.


Jones, M. J. (1992). The influence of age, teaching style, and classroom activity on elementary students' attitudes toward music class. A field report presented to the College of Arts and Sciences, Drake University.


discriminations and preferences of musicians and non-musicians.
In C. K. Madsen & C. Prickett (Eds.), Applications of research in
music behavior (pp. 175-189). Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama
Press.

attentiveness based on rehearsal activity and teacher behavior.

Zimmerman, M. P. & Sechrest, L. (1970). Brief focused instruction and
musical concepts. Journal of Research in Music Education, 18 (1),
25-36.
APPENDIX A
STUDENT PRE-STUDY QUESTIONNAIRE
Please answer how you feel at this time.
This is not a test and will not affect your grade in any way.
Your teacher will not see this completed form.
YOUR PARTICIPATION IS TOTALLY VOLUNTARY AND YOU MAY STOP WHENEVER YOU WANT.

Circle one: Boy  Girl
Circle one: 4B  4S  5B  5C  6C  6R
Student Number: __________

A. Most of the time I enjoy going to this school.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE

B. In music class, my favorite activity is listening to recorded music.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE

C. In music class, my favorite activity is singing.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE

D. In music class, my favorite activity is playing classroom instruments.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE

E. In music class, my favorite activity is playing musical games.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE

F. When I'm not in school, I enjoy listening to or attending symphony concerts.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE

G. When I'm not in school, I enjoy listening to or attending operas.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE

H. When I'm not in school, I enjoy listening to or attending jazz concerts.  AGREE  UNSURE  DISAGREE
APPENDIX B
STUDENT RESPONSE FORM

Please answer how you feel at this time.
This is not a test and will not affect your grade in any way.
Your teacher will not see this completed form.
YOUR PARTICIPATION IS TOTALLY VOLUNTARY AND
YOU MAY STOP WHENEVER YOU WANT.

Circle one: Boy   Girl
Circle one: 4B   4S   5B   5C   6C   6R

Student Number: ________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice:</th>
<th>like</th>
<th>like</th>
<th>unsure</th>
<th>dislike</th>
<th>dislike</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>very much</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>very much</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>like</th>
<th>like</th>
<th>unsure</th>
<th>dislike</th>
<th>dislike</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>very much</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>like</th>
<th>like</th>
<th>unsure</th>
<th>dislike</th>
<th>dislike</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>very much</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>like</th>
<th>like</th>
<th>unsure</th>
<th>dislike</th>
<th>dislike</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>very much</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>like</td>
<td>very much</td>
<td>like</td>
<td>unsure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX C

Response Form Recorded Directions

You are about to receive a piece of paper called Student Pilot Response Form. Please do not write your name on this paper. Do not pick up your pencil until you are instructed to write.

[Pause tape while response forms are handed out.]

Because this is such a successful class, you are being asked to participate in an elementary music education project. There are eight musical selections that will be played and you will be asked to respond to each selection by circling the number that best describes your feeling about that selection.

Please follow along with your finger as I read the directions found at the top of this paper. Read silently as I read aloud.

Please answer how you feel at this time. This is not a test and will not affect your grade in any way. Your teacher will not see this completed form. Your participation is totally voluntary and you may stop whenever you want.

Are there any questions?

[Pause tape for response time and answers.] [Keep track of questions/responses.]

Please pick up your pencil at this time.

Beneath the opening instructions, the form says "Circle One: Boy or Girl." Please circle the correct response now.

The next line says "Circle One" and lists a set of numbers and letters. Circle the number and letter that describes your class now.

There is a blank after the words "Student Number." Your classroom teacher has assigned each student a number. Please write your number in the blank at this time. When you are done, please put your pencil on your desk.
Under your student number there is a box that says "Practice." You are about to hear a musical selection. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection is over. Once the musical selection is over, please circle the number that best describes how you feel about the selection: #1 means you like it very much, #2 means you like it, #3 means you are unsure -- you can't decide if you like it or not, #4 means that you dislike the piece of music, and #5 means that you dislike the piece of music very much.

Are there any questions?

Please listen to the practice example now.

Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the music you just heard. After you have circled your response in the practice box, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction.

We are now ready to listen to musical selection A. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection has ended. This is selection A.

Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection A, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction.

We are now ready to listen to musical selection B. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection has ended. This is selection B.
Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection B, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction.

We are now ready to listen to musical selection C. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection has ended. This is selection C.

[Play recording of selection C.]

Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection C, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction.

We are now ready to listen to selection D, so please turn your response form over. At the top of the page you see the responses for selection D. Please leave your pencil down until the end of the musical selection. This is selection D.

[Play recording of selection D.]

Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection D, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction.

We are now ready to listen to musical selection E. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection has ended. This is selection E.

[Play recording of selection E.]

Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection E, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction.

We are now ready to listen to musical selection F. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection has ended. This is selection F.

[Play recording of selection F.]
Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection F, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction. We are now ready to listen to musical selection G. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection has ended. This is selection G.

[Play recording of selection G.]

Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection G, please put your pencil down and wait for the next direction.

We are now ready to listen to musical selection H. Please leave your pencil down until the musical selection has ended. This is selection H.

[Play recording of selection H.]

Please pick up your pencil and circle the number that best describes your feelings about the selection. After you have circled your response for selection H, please put your pencil down.

Thank you for your help with this very important project. Please sit quietly until your paper has been collected.
APPENDIX D
Recording Information

"Non piú andrai"
by Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart

Opera 1: Le Nozze di Figaro
EMI Records Ltd. #7 47978 8
Wiener Philharmoniker
conducted by Ricardo Muti

"On the Sunny Side of the Street"

Jazz
Music and You, Level 5
MacMillan Publishing Company

"Every Time I Feel the Spirit"

Spiritual
Music and You, Level 6
MacMillan Publishing Company

"Hello My Baby"

Ragtime
Music and You, Level 6
MacMillan Publishing Company

"Take Me Home, Country Road"

Country
Music and You, Level 6
MacMillan Publishing Company

"Lonesome Valley"

Folk
Music and You, Level 6
MacMillan Publishing Company

"Schnelle Füsse"
by Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart

Opera 2: Die Zauberflöte
Deutsch Grammophon #410 967-2 GH3
Berliner Philharmoniker
conducted by Herbert von Karajan

"Olives and Quinces"
by Gian Carlo Menotti

Opera 3: Amahl and the Night Visitors
RCA Gold Seal #6485-2-RG
Original Cast of the NBC Telecast
Thomas Schippers, conducting
APPENDIX E

November 1, 1993

Dear __________:

I am continuing in my research project and want to thank you for the input that you provided in the opera selection process. I would like further assistance with this project. In order to create an unbiased selection of musical styles and compositions, I am requesting that you please complete the following questionnaire.

I need your assistance with the following:

1. Please list five different musical styles that you think are appropriate for study in upper elementary music education classes.
2. Following each style, please write the names of two vocal/instrumental combination pieces that you think elementary students are unfamiliar with, but should become acquainted.

Your help is greatly appreciated. Enclosed is a self-addressed, stamped envelope. All forms should be returned to me as soon as possible, but no later than Wednesday, November 10, 1993. Thank you for your continued support and cooperation.

Sincerely,

Penny Zaugg
205 Mitchell Avenue SW
Mitchellville, Iowa 50169
(515) 967-4867
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MUSICAL STYLES</th>
<th>COMPOSITION</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>ARTIST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>A.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>A.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>A.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>A.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>A.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>