A Field Report
Presented to
Jolie Scholz LeVere
The Graduate Division
Drake University

Approved by Committee:

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Music Education

by
Jolie Scholz LeVere
January 1966
RECORDE-E-TYPE INSTRUMENTS AS AN AID IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF MUSIC READING

Approved by Committee:

Jolie Scholz LeVere

INDEX OF LITERATURE

Table of Contents

1. Introduction to the Problem

2. Literature Related to the Problem

3. Methodology of the Study

4. Method of Procedure

5. Report of the Study

6. Conclusion of Study

Approved by Committee:

Nathan E. Jones

Earte J. Canfield

Dean of the Graduate Division

236259
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. THE PROBLEM AND REVIEW OF LITERATURE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Importance of the study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Terms</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music reading</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recorder-type instrument</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of the problem</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization of remainder of study</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review of Literature</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature related to the problem</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. THE SETTING, PROCEDURE AND REPORT OF THE STUDY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE STUDY</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting of the Study</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method of Procedure</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of the Study</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. SUMMARY, OBSERVATIONS, AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Per cent of Group A and B in Percentile Rankings According to Scores Received on Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment in Indianola, Iowa, May, 1965</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

THE PROBLEM AND REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The problem of reading music is virtually as old as music itself. Much has been written on the problem of teaching music reading to children as part of the general music program in the elementary school. It would seem that the authorities cannot agree as to the best method of teaching children to read music.

Statement of the problem. It was the purpose of this study to determine whether the use of recorder-type instruments in an instrumental approach to music reading would aid in the development of music reading.

Importance of the study. Music reading has been one of the major areas of concern for the music educator in the elementary schools.

Warren Joseph stated that there seems to be no argument that every singer (or every musician) needs some sort of system for reading notes or pitches or ideas. The difference of opinion occurs when we try to decide the
relative merits of one "system" of music reading as opposed to another.1

Anne Pierce referred to the lack of one "system" as guaranteed to produce good music readers by saying that despite articles, manuals, reports, and research studies available, no one has yet described a definite series of steps which a teacher may follow with certainty that, at the end, all children will become proficient music readers.2

The ability to read music is an essential part of a well-rounded music education, and its development should be given proper consideration in the general music class. It is a step to musical understanding and appreciation—one which, when well taught, leads to perpetually delightful adventures into the realm of music.

II. DEFINITION OF TERMS

Music reading. Music reading is the ability to translate a system of formal arrangements of abstract symbols into the meaningful patterns of sound and movement for which they stand only as reminders. Music reading is used instead of sight singing because the latter is based upon the former. Sight singing is a more expeditious development of music reading, just as running is a speeding up of walking.

---

**Recorder-type instruments.** Recorder-type instruments are also called exploratory instruments, pre-orchestral instruments, pre-band instruments, melodic flutes and fifes. They are known by the commercial names given by their manufacturers: Song Flute, Tonette, Melody Flute, Symphonette, Flutophone, and others. They are usually made of unbreakable plastic, and sell for somewhere between 75 cents and $1.50. Most of the flutes and fifes are built in the key of C, which means that a given note on the flute will have the same pitch as the same note on the piano. The range, however, is limited, extending on several of the instruments from middle C (C on the line below the treble staff) up to fourth line D on the treble staff.

**Limitations of the problem.** The purpose of this study was not to prove the validity or reliability of the tests which were given in an attempt to study the use of recorder-type instruments as an aid in the development of music reading. Neither was it the purpose to find the one best way to teach music reading. The study was carried on in the Indianola Schools and the results are not intended to be conclusive or applicable to any other school system.

**Organization of remainder of study.** The remainder of Chapter I will contain a review of the literature related to the problem. Chapter II will present the setting, procedures, and report of the study in Indianola, Iowa. Summary, observations and conclusions will be in Chapter III.
III. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Literature related to the problem. Men have long attempted to find practical ways of learning to read music notation. Roughly one thousand years ago two monks sought to improve the skill of their respective choirs in this regard. One of them, Guido d'Arezzo, is said to have invented a system of Latin syllables used as a measuring stick to identify scale tones. In the United States this system has evolved to become the moveable do system because "do" represents the keynote of all major keys. The other monk, Odo of Clugny, chose an instrumental approach, and is said to have had his choir learn to play the monochord, a one-stringed Greek instrument, and then apply this understanding to singing by notation. These two approaches to teaching music reading, the Latin-syllable and the instrumental, are both very much alive today.

In 1835 music was made a part of the curriculum in Boston under the direction of Lowell Mason. At this time the music program consisted largely of drill on notes, learning to read music, and practice in unison singing of songs. A little later the child-study movement placed emphasis upon ability to appreciate and enjoy music as the great aim of music education. A good music program today includes singing,
rhythms, listening to music, playing instruments, learning to read music, and creative activities.

James Mursell stated why music reading necessarily belongs in a program planned for the promotion of musical growth, and pointed toward the realization of human values through musical growth.

In a program planned to promote musical growth, the development of music-reading ability will proceed as the development of a progressively clearer, fuller, and better understanding of music. When a child is being properly taught to read music, he is being taught to understand music. When a child is being properly taught to understand music, he is being taught to read music. I will go so far as to say that no one can be taught really to understand music without being taught to understand the symbols and concepts on which reading depends. To read music and to understand music are two aspects of the same process.  

Peter W. Dykema and Hannah Cundiff said that "the ability to read music readily and accurately is granted by everyone to be a valuable accomplishment. That this ability extends one's musical horizon and produces a stimulating feeling of power is not to be doubted."  

Robert and Vernice Nye asserted that learning to read music notation is an integral part of music—if music is taught fully. "If music reading is taught right, it always serves for the children an immediately functional or

---


interesting purpose. Failure to gain reasonable skill in reading music bars children from important growth—social and cultural as well as musical. ¹

There should not be some formidable moment when the grim realities of the notation are forced upon the children. Mursell stated that, "Music reading should emerge and develop from a natural, understandable, achievable connection of eye and ear, beginning even with gestures indicating the up and down of pitch."²

Joseph Hartley has listed several signs of readiness for music reading.

1. An interest in wanting to learn new songs.
2. An awareness of similar tonal and rhythm patterns.
3. An awareness of tones—loud and soft tones, high and low, long and short—and varying tempos.
4. Taking part in rhythmic activities such as dancing, marching and creative rhythms.
5. Active participation in singing.
6. A desire to know about instruments—their tones and mechanical manipulation.
7. A desire to play an instrument.
8. A desire to learn to read music.³

There are many arguments for placing the interpretation of the score in the program of music education in

² Mursell, op. cit., p. 48.
the elementary school. Brooks and Brown stated, "Without the mastery of the score, the child is excluded from interesting participation in musical activities and experiences." After a certain stage in the child's musical development, a program limited to listening to music, singing songs by ear-imitation, and gaining information about music would certainly be inadequate and might seriously restrict the value of music education.¹

Recently, Alfred Ellison, Associate Professor of Education at New York University, said "Very few children learn to read music when the traditional approaches are used. In schools, by and large, very few children who are not learning to play an instrument ever learn to read music."²

Louise Kifer Myers asserted that "it is easier to learn to read music through instruments than through the voice, since tones depend on mechanical manipulation and not on the musical memory."³ The instrumentalist who can read music at sight is able to do so for the following reasons:

1. He automatically comprehends the various symbols and guides to interpretation on the printed page--eye recognition.

---

¹Brooks and Brown, op. cit., p. 176.


2. He has sufficient technical ability for playing the composition, which enables his muscles to respond automatically to the impressions received by his eyes—physical response.

3. His eyes travel across the music, recognizing groups of symbols at least a measure before they must be played. By doing so, there is time for scrutiny of unusual rhythmic patterns or combinations of notes. The singer who can read a song accurately is able to do so for the following reasons:

1. He automatically comprehends the various symbols and guides to interpretation on the printed page—eye recognition.

2. He has sufficient vocal control so that his voice responds automatically to the combinations of tone recalled by his musical memory from the impressions received by his eyes—vocal response—physical.

3. His eyes travel ahead of his voice in the process of symbol and word recognition. By doing so, there is time for careful scrutiny of unusual rhythmic patterns or combinations of words.

In considering what is involved in the performance of the instrumentalist and the singer, the apparent difference is in item two: the instrumentalist's reaction to symbols is muscular, whereas the same symbols set the singer's memory to work.

Louise Myers stated that it is easier to learn to read music through instruments than through the voice, since tones depend on mechanical manipulation and not on the musical memory.

---

1Ibid., p. 175.
2Ibid., p. 176.
3Ibid.
Alfred Ellison supported the above opinion by saying:

The voice is not directly responsible to conscious physical manipulation. Consider then the tremendous difficulty of relating a specific staff location of a tone to this imprecise and indeterminable physical control of the vocal apparatus. Consider, too, how simple it is to describe and reproduce any single tone or group of tones on a musical instrument. This is rational and subject to individual understanding and control. ¹

Ellison continued by stating that it is possible, indeed usual, to spend six years in school music attempting to teach children to read notes using the voice as a medium and not achieve the success in this skill that can accompany six months of instruction on an instrument.² The kind of instrument seems to make no difference. Any instrument, even the so-called "toy-instruments," provides a medium for learning notation that far surpasses the voice.³

Nye and Nye supported the above statements by saying that "one of the easiest ways for children to sense pitch differences and interval relationships is by their playing melody instruments."⁴ They also recommend through the use of song bells, piano, recorder-type and flute-type instruments, relating this to singing.

¹Ellison, op. cit., pp. 42-43.
²Ibid., pp. 42-43. ³Ibid.
⁴Nye and Nye, op. cit., pp. 174-175.
A study made by Nye and Nye at Highland Park, Illinois, in 1948-1949 yielded conclusive evidence that an approach to music reading consisting of a minimal use of numbers combined with an emphasis on easy-to-play instruments was much more effective than an approach consisting almost exclusively of the use of Latin syllables.\(^1\)

Coleman believed that it is easier for the child to learn to read staff notation on an instrument than in singing; for the instrument gives him the tone immediately (if he strikes the right note), even though he may not be able to find the right tone with his voice.\(^2\) It is gratifying to the young learner to hear the correct tone merely by pressing a finger; thus, note-reading seems to function better when there is something tangible to work with.

In general, we have failed to teach masses of children to read music. Mary Asher, Supervisor of Music in the Philadelphia Public Schools stated:

> We have failed primarily because we restricted ourselves to singing. The child who was weak in singing could hardly be expected to acquire skills in music reading. The use of an instrument gives the learner a blueprint, a visual reinforcement, a practical reference point. In the mainstream of American education, the instrumentalists have invariably been the "music readers."\(^3\)

---

\(^1\)Ellison, *op. cit.*, p. 43.


\(^3\)Mary Asher, "Musical Understandings via the Electric Organ," *The Instructor* (February, 1965), 117.
Louis Wersen also supported the idea that "early instrument experiences can and do mean better vocal experiences. Singing is, and should be, the part of the music program given most attention in the elementary school." But teachers working with children know that the child with the instrumental experience is the one most likely to recognize tonal groups, to be able to read musical notation, and to express rhythmic patterns. As children participate actively in making tones, the number of so-called montones or nonmusical children is likely to decrease.¹

At present, there is a movement in some music education circles toward an instrumental approach to notation which tends to create a purpose and a feeling of value in reading music. It has long been recognized that the best readers are frequently those with instrumental backgrounds, but it has only been recently that most educators have seen the value of giving all children simple instrumental experience as a specific means of teaching notation.

Carl B. Nelson conducted an investigation in the Edina, Minnesota schools during the 1952-1953 school year. By the use of control and experimental groups, he deduced from valid tests given the groups, that there was significant progress in understanding of basic music.

¹Louis G. Wersen, "Better Music in Your Classroom," The Instructor (February, 1965), 100.
notation and terminology plus other phases of music to warrant the continuation of such a program.\textsuperscript{1}

In the use of recorder-type instruments, two important factors should be considered: (1) the instrument must provide an excellent means of musical exploration, and (2) it must be comparatively easy to play, in at least the initial stages. These two factors remove recorder-type instruments from the toy class as well as the major instrument class.\textsuperscript{2}

Anne Pierce, State University of Iowa, contended that the use of toy or easily played instruments and standard instruments aids in interpreting the staff and its symbols because, on an instrument, children can produce the correct pitch by pressing or striking the right key. Singing is less tangible, for pupils must first hear the pitch before they can produce it.\textsuperscript{3}

According to Mathews of the University of Missouri, one of the best aids in the development of part-singing and of music reading generally may be had in the use of recorder-type instruments, and in the use of instruments of the orchestra and band. They are as important as the singing


\textsuperscript{2}Traugott Rohner, "Exploratory Instruments," \textit{The Instrumentalist} (September, 1953), 39-42.

\textsuperscript{3}Pierce, op. cit., p. 81.
program and their use is so recognized in several of the recent classroom song books, which indicate songs which are best suited for playing on these instruments.¹

Up to this point only the advantages of the use of recorder-type instruments as an aid in the development of music reading have been discussed. Mathews discussed the disadvantages of recorder-type instruments in his book, "You Can Teach Music." The chief disadvantages of the instruments are their limited range and the comparatively poor quality of musical tone.²

Nye and Nye stated the dangers of the instrumental approach as being: (1) children's interest in this one segment of the general music program may cause undue emphasis on instrumental activities to the detriment of other aspects of balanced musical growth, and (2) children's playing the instruments out of tune can make such experiences worthless.³

Educators cannot agree upon the one approach to music reading which will insure results. Some have advocated an instrumental approach through the use of recorder-type instruments, while others believe such a


²Ibid., p. 122.

³Nye and Nye, op. cit., p. 84.
program has many disadvantages. It remains to be proven, however, whether an instrumental approach in the elementary music program actually surpasses the more traditional vocal approach to music reading.

In the growing tendency to give less time and effort to skill in music reading, the Music Conference re-affirms the belief in the necessity to perform music easily and enjoyfully.

The setting of the study is...
Despite the growing tendency to give less time and attention to acquiring skill in music reading, the Music Educators National Conference reaffirms the belief in the importance of an ability to perform music easily and accurately from the printed page. The setting of the study, procedures, and report of the study will be stated in this chapter.

**I. SETTING OF THE STUDY**

The setting of the study was the Indianola Independent Schools, Indianola, Iowa, located 15 miles south of Des Moines, Iowa. There is an enrollment of 2,687 in the four Elementary schools, one Junior High, and one High School. There are also ten children in the Indianola School District enrolled in special education classes. The population of Indianola is about 7,500 with a large portion of the community commuting to Des Moines for work. Simpson College, located in Indianola, makes a large contribution to the financial and cultural climate of the town.

---

The study, which lasted from September 1964 to May 1965, took place in the four elementary schools in Indianola. Only the eight fourth-grade classes, with an enrollment of 223, were used. A recorder-type instrument program was introduced in the four fourth-grade classes at Emerson and Hawthorne Elementary Schools in an instrumental approach to music reading. Irving and Whittier Elementary Schools continued to use the vocal approach to music reading through the use of syllables.

The fourth-grade level was chosen for several reasons:

(1) to begin the program at a level where it could be followed through to its greatest development, (2) to reach the child while he is eager and ready to learn, (3) to begin the program where few students had begun private lessons, and (4) to begin when co-ordination is developed to the extent that the child may easily manipulate the instrument.

The fourth-grade music classes of approximately 30 pupils per class, met twice weekly for a period of thirty minutes. Music classes are taught by a special music teacher. Each student is in at least one program every year. Since there were no music rooms in any of the four elementary schools, classes met in the gym when available, the stage, or in classrooms. Most of the time the fourth-grade met in the gym or the stage where there are no desks, only folding chairs.
In grades one through three, the children experimented with rhythm instrument accompaniments, created songs, learned new songs, listened and moved to music, and observed written music symbols as readiness for reading music.

The children were observed for signs of readiness for music reading using Hartley's criteria, stated as:

1. An interest in wanting to learn new songs.
2. An awareness of similar tonal and rhythm patterns.
3. An awareness of tones - loud and soft tones, high and low, long and short - varying tempos.
4. Taking part in rhythmic activities such as dancing, marching and creative rhythms.
5. Active participation in singing.
6. A desire to know about instruments - their tones and mechanical manipulation.
7. A desire to play an instrument.
8. A desire to learn to read music.

In the writer's opinion, about 90 per cent of the children were ready to begin music reading, based on Hartley's criteria stated above.

II. METHOD OF PROCEDURE

In September, 1964, the fourth-grades at Hawthorne and Emerson Elementary schools were shown several recorder-type instruments. The final selection of the one to use was made with the help of the students after a discussion of the shape, tone quality, and range of several brands of recorder-type instruments. After the selection was made, 

1Hartley, loc. cit.
letters were sent home to the parents explaining the program and informing them of the required purchase of an instrument at $1.00 each. There was no opposition to the program from any of the parents.

The school purchased the instruments and sold them to the children. A total of 111 participated in the four classes at Emerson and Hawthorne Schools. Those unable to pay $1.00 were provided instruments. They were marked with the name of the student and kept in their desks in the homeroom. Instructions were given in proper sterilization of the instruments. Children were free to take their recorder-type instruments home for practice. However, if they forgot to bring them to class twice, this privilege was taken away.

Since no desks were provided in the "music room", individual music was difficult for class work. All songs to be learned were put on staff-lined newsprint and hung at the front of the class. Individual music was given to the students for practice at home after the songs were presented in class.

A "sing and play" approach was used throughout the instrumental program. With each new song to be learned, the children would:

1. Sing the song with words.
2. Sing the song with letter names.
3. Practice Silent fingering.
4. Play the tune on the recorder-type instrument.
5. Gradually clean up the errors and step up the tempo.

6. Add piano and rhythm instruments for enjoyment of accomplishment.\(^1\)

---

Below is an outline of the introduction to recorder-type instruments given in the first lesson:

1. Place your left thumb over the hole at the back of the instrument and your pointer finger on the top hole on the opposite side. Your right thumb fits the thumb-rest at the middle of the back. This note is "B". Cover the holes carefully and firmly.

2. Now you are ready to blow. Place about one-half inch of the mouthpiece between your lips. Notice that skips in a tune are made by lifting the tone by touching your tongue to the mouthpiece opening, then draw it away letting the air through, as if saying "too". Start each tone in this way.

3. Blow easily. Use just enough force to get a smooth and pleasing tone. Do not puff out your cheeks!

4. Take a breath through the corners of the mouth on either side of the instrument, never through the nose. The nose is a filter and admits air slowly. The instrument player must fill the lungs rapidly so that the tune is not broken.

---

\(^1\) Lorrian E. Watters, "Tunes for Tonettes" (Des Moines, Iowa: Director of Music Education, 1962), p. 6. (Mimeographed.)
5. Blow several practice tones, starting each tone in
    with "too". Now add the left middle finger
    and blow. This note is "A". Next, add the
    left third finger. This note is "G".

    The first song was put on a large sheet of staff-
lined newsprint for use during this introduction period so
the students did not have to be bothered with individual
music sheets. The rest of the lesson followed the "sing
and play" approach as stated above. This was applied to the
first as well as all succeeding songs.

Below is list of suggestions for better playing which
were given at various times, when needed:

1. Notice that skips in a tune are made by lifting
   or putting down two or more fingers at the same
   time. All fingers above the one you wish to
   move.  To play must cover their holes; all fingers below
   are raised and their holes uncovered.

2. Be sure to put the pad of the finger over the holes
   of the instrument. The other half goes the second
   thumb.

3. Curve your fingers a little over the holes.

4. Be sure the left hand thumb completely covers the
   thumb hole on the back of the instrument.

5. Notice that when the notes go down on the staff,
   the fingers go down on the instrument.

6. Blow lighter on the low notes. Played "Jingle Bells"
   and "Silent Night."
Below are some suggestions for the teacher to do in order to have a more successful learning experience:

1. Have half the room play their instruments while the other half sings the song.
2. Be sure to check the pitch of the instruments as they may be tuned somewhat.
3. When the children are to do silent fingering, have them place the tip of the instrument on their chins.

The above three lists were applied to the instrumental program in the Hawthorne and Emerson Schools.

Songs were selected from the basic music text and supplementary text-book series. Descants that were included with the songs were played on the instruments by a small group of students while the rest of the class sang the melody. The students also wrote their own descants for several songs. A small group of students played the notes of chords while the rest sang the melody. One-half of the class played the melody while the other half sang the second part in two-part music. This was done as an introduction to two-part music.

The instruments were used in the Christmas programs at Emerson and Hawthorne Schools. Everyone played "Joy to the World" and "Go Tell Aunt Rhodie." Several small groups which had done extra outside practice played "Jingle Bells" and "Silent Night."
The instruments in combination with singing, were used about two-thirds of the time. The other one-third of the music class was spent in listening activities, creative activities, and rhythmic activities. Towards the end of the year, a unit on instruments of the orchestra was presented to prepare students for selection of an instrument for private instruction in the fifth grade. String, woodwind, brass, and percussion lessons are provided free of charge to all students who have an instrument.

Irving and Whittier Elementary Schools used the vocal approach to music reading. Syllables were used in an attempt to teach the children the elements of music reading. Songs were sung with syllables and then with words. Rhythm instruments and the piano were then added to the songs. These four fourth-grade classes also listened to records, created songs, and entered into various rhythmic activities.

Testing in Indiana. The Schueller-Kish Test is a comprehensive inventory of the knowledge about music and

III. REPORT OF THE STUDY

When it was decided that a standardized test of musical accomplishment would be used to help evaluate the classroom instrumental program, criteria was set up for selection of the appropriate one. The test would have to be reliable and valid. It would have to be easy to administer and score. Since the test would be given in various classroom situations, some with pianos and some without, it would have to be administered without the use of a piano of
The last requirement was that it be group administered rather than individually administered.

Four tests were selected as possibilities for the final selection. Letters were written to obtain sample copies of all four tests. Two of the tests were not available from the publishers. The third test required a piano for administering. The Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment was the only test available that met the criteria set up for the selection of a test of musical accomplishment to be used in the study.

Percentiles were provided in the Manual of Directions for Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment. The norms are based upon scores earned by 5,414 pupils in grades IV to XII in seven states.

In May, 1965, the Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment was administered to all fourth-grade children in Indianola. The Kwalwasser-Ruch Test is a comprehensive inventory of the knowledge about music and the skill in music which a pupil may possess.

The test consists of ten batteries as listed below:

1. Knowledge of musical symbols and terms.
2. Recognition of Syllable names.
3. Detection of pitch errors in a familiar melody.

---

1 Jacob Kwalwasser, Ph.D. and G. M. Ruch, Ph.D., "Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment for Grades IV-XII" (Iowa City, Iowa: Extension Division, University of Iowa, 1924.)
4. Detection of time errors in a familiar melody.
5. Recognition of pitch names.
8. Knowledge of note values.
10. Recognition of familiar melodies from notation.

The test scores were divided into three categories according to instrumental experience:

1. Group A - Hawthorne and Emerson students with no previous lessons but with class recorder-type instrument lessons.
2. Group B - Irving and Whittier students with no previous lessons but with class work in music reading with syllables.
3. Group C - Hawthorne, Emerson, Irving, and Whittier students with previous lessons on an instrument.

Group A consisted of seventy-seven children from Hawthorne and Emerson Schools who had had no previous private lessons on an instrument but had class lessons on a recorder-type instrument as an aid in music reading.

Group B consisted of seventy-four children from Irving and Whittier Schools who had no previous private lessons and used syllables in a vocal approach to music reading.
Since no special classes could be set up during the school day to include only the students with no previous instrumental instruction, all students were included in the class. Test scores of Group C were excluded from the study since they all had previous private instrumental instruction and could read music per cent in the 90th percentile, while

The data from the Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment as seen in Table I, indicate Group A had 80 per cent of the scores above the median, while Group B had 15 per cent in the 60th percentile. Group A had 15 per cent in

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentile</th>
<th>Per cent of Group A</th>
<th>Per cent of Group B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>90-99</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-89</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-79</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-69</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-29</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
had 51 per cent above the median. These figures were arrived at by adding the percentages from the 50th to the 90th percentiles in Group A and Group B. Group A had 30 per cent below the median, while Group B had 49 per cent of the scores below the median.

Group A had 9 per cent in the 90th percentile, while Group B had only 3 per cent of the scores in the 90th percentile. Group A had 13 per cent of the scores in the 80th percentile, while Group B had only 5 per cent of the scores in the 80th percentile. Group A had 15 per cent in the 70th percentile, while Group B had only 8 per cent of the scores in the 70th percentile. Group A had 25 per cent of the scores in the 60th percentile, while Group B had only 15 per cent of the scores in the 60th percentile.

The purpose of the study was to determine whether the use of recorder-type instruments in an instrumental approach to music reading would aid in the development of music reading. The scores of Group C were not used in the study since all the students in this group had previous private lessons and could read music.
SUMMARY, OBSERVATIONS, AND CONCLUSIONS

This chapter will present a summary of the previous chapters, observations of the study by the writer, and conclusions based on the data presented in Chapter II.

I. SUMMARY

II. OBSERVATIONS

III. CONCLUSIONS

It was the purpose of this study to determine whether the use of recorder-type instruments in an instrumental approach to music reading would aid in the development of music reading. Literature related to the topic was reviewed, the setting, and procedure of the study was stated, and the data from the Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment were presented.

As a result of the recorder-type instrument program, the children in Group A became more aware of written music, its structure, and the symbols. The number of non-singers in Group A decreased from approximately twenty per cent in September, to seven per cent in May. A greater interest was expressed in the fifth-grade instrumental program.
In an interview with Glenn M. Peterson, Instrumental Instructor in the Indianola, Iowa, Community Schools, he said:

The class instrumental program in the fourth-grade increased interest in the fifth-grade instrumental program on the part of both students and parents. Those students who had the class recorder-type instrument instruction were better prepared to begin private lessons on an instrument. The introduction to the band instrument was easier and results were seen faster.¹

³ enumerator-type instruments actually surpasses the more vocal approach, which was carried on in

III. CONCLUSIONS

The data from the Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment indicate Group A, the students with the class recorder-type instrument lessons, had 80 per cent of the scores of the students above the median. Group B, the students using the vocal approach to music reading, had only 51 per cent of the scores above the median. This would seem to indicate that Group A showed more knowledge about music and the skill in music reading.

The playing or instrumental activities of the general music program constitute not an end in themselves but an important aid in the teaching of better listening, singing, musical discrimination, creativity, part-singing, and music reading, and serve as an introduction to simple music theory—all in a setting that children enjoy,

¹Glenn M. Peterson, Indianola Community Schools, Indianola, Iowa, in an interview, October, 1965. Permission to quote secured.
understand, and know to be purposeful. Instrumental activities in general music are both psychologically and physiologically sound in their appeal to the natural impulses of young Americans to be active and to manipulate a variety of things.

It remains to be proven, however, whether an instrumental approach to music reading through the use of recorder-type instruments actually surpasses the more traditional vocal approach. The study was carried on in the Indianola Schools, Indianola, Iowa, and the results are not intended to be conclusive or applicable to any other school system.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. BOOKS


BIBLIOGRAPHY


B. PERIODICALS


BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. BOOKS


B. PERIODICALS


C. PUBLICATIONS OF THE GOVERNMENT, LEARNED SOCIETIES, AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Kwalwasser, Jacob, Ph.D., and G. M. Ruch, Ph.D. Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment for Grades IV-XII. Iowa City, Iowa: Extension Division, University of Iowa, 1924.

D. UNPUBLISHED MATERIALS

Kwalwasser-Ruch Test of Musical Accomplishment

For Grades IV-XII

By Jacob Kwalwasser, Ph.D.
Professor of Music Education
Syracuse University, Syracuse, N.Y.

And G. M. Ruch, Ph.D.
Professor of Education
University of California, Berkeley

Do not open this paper, or turn it over, until you are told to do so. Fill these blanks, giving your name, age, birthday, etc. Write plainly.

Name........................................ Date

Age last birthday........... years. Birthday (Month and day)

Grade................................. Teacher

School................................. City

How many years have you studied music in school?

How long have you studied music outside of school? (state your answer in half-hour lessons)

Do not write below this line.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEST</th>
<th>NAME OF TEST</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Knowledge of Musical Symbols and Terms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Recognition of Syllable Names</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Detection of Pitch Errors in a Familiar Melody</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Detection of Time Errors in a Familiar Melody</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Recognition of Pitch Names</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Knowledge of Time Signatures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Knowledge of Key Signatures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Knowledge of Note Values</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Knowledge of Rest Values</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Recognition of Familiar Melodies from Notation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Do Not Turn Over The Page Until The Signal is Given!
**TEST 1. KNOWLEDGE OF MUSICAL SYMBOLS AND TERMS**

**DIRECTIONS:** Below are twenty-five questions about music. Five answers are given to each question. Read each question and then draw a line under the right answer. The sample is already marked as it should be.

**SAMPLE:** $\text{\texttt{d}}$ is called a sharp natural flat note rest

- Begin here:
  1. The first tone of the scale is $\text{\texttt{mi re do fa sol}}$
  2. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ is called a rest natural sharp note flat
  3. The fifth tone of a scale is $\text{\texttt{do fa mi sol re}}$
  4. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ is a flat note natural rest sharp
  5. $\text{\texttt{b}}$ is a sharp flat natural note rest
  6. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ is a slur hold rest double-sharp repeat - bar
  7. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ is called a sharp flat natural note rest
  8. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means soft loud slow fast smooth
  9. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ is called a bar staff measure accent clef
  10. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ is a sharp flat natural note rest
  11. is a clef staff measure accent phrase
  12. is called a clef staff measure accent bar
  13. is a clef measure staff phrase accent bar
  14. the curved line is a slur tie hold accent rest
  15. the curved line is a slur hold rest tie accent
  16. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means higher lower louder repeat pause
  17. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means higher lower louder softer pause
  18. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means lively slow repeat accent sweetly
  19. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means fast loud slow soft smooth
  20. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means softer louder slower faster smooth
  21. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means repeat accent sweetly slow lively
  22. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means soft quick separated connected loud
  23. $\text{\texttt{d}}$ means quick soft separated connected loud

**TEST 2. RECOGNITION OF SYLLABLE NAMES**

**DIRECTIONS:** Below are five lines of notes. The first syllable in each line is "Do," so the name do has been written below it. You are to write the syllable names on the lines under the other notes.

- Begin here.

**TEST 3. DETECTION OF PITCH ERRORS IN A FAMILIAR MELODY**

**DIRECTIONS:** The song "America" is written below. One measure has been crossed out because the melody is wrong. Five other measures are wrong. Hum over the melody to yourself and cross out all five wrong measures.

- Begin here.
TEST 4. RECOGNITION OF TIME ERRORS IN A FAMILIAR MELODY.

DIRECTIONS: The song “America” is written below. One of the measures has been crossed out because it has the wrong number of beats. Five other measures are wrong. Hum the song and cross out all five wrong measures.

Begin here:

```
\[ \text{Crossed out measure:} \]
```

Test 4. Number right = Score

TEST 5. RECOGNITION OF PITCH NAMES.

DIRECTIONS: Below are four lines of notes. The first note in each line is already marked as it should be. You are to write the pitch or letter names on the lines under the other notes.

Begin here:

```
C
D
F
A
```

Test 5. Number right = Score

[4]

TEST 6. KNOWLEDGE OF TIME SIGNATURES.

DIRECTIONS: Below are ten full measures. At the right of each are five time signatures. You are to draw a line under the correct time signature for each measure. The sample is marked as it should be.

SAMPLE:

```
\[ \text{Correct time signature:} \]
```

Begin here:

```
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
```

Test 6. Number right = Score

[5]
TEST 7. KNOWLEDGE OF KEY SIGNATURES

**DIRECTIONS:** At the left below is a column of ten major key signatures. At the right is a column of five minor key signatures. You are to write the name of the keys on the lines at the right of each signature. Notice that there are two columns, one for major keys and one for minor keys.

**SAMPLES:**
- **Major Key Signatures:** C, F, C#, G, D, A, E, B, F#.  
- **Minor Key Signatures:** C, F, C#, G, D, A, E, B, F#

**Begin here.**

**Test 7. Number right = X 2 = Score**

---

TEST 8. KNOWLEDGE OF NOTE VALUES

**DIRECTIONS:** In the measures below a note has been left out of each. You are to draw a line under the note needed to complete the measure. The sample is already marked as it should be.

**SAMPLE:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Note Needed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Test 8 Number right = X 3 = Score**

---

TEST 9. KNOWLEDGE OF REST VALUES

**DIRECTIONS:** The five measures below are incomplete and need a rest to complete them. You are to draw a line under the rest needed to complete the measure. The sample is already marked as it should be.

**SAMPLE:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Rest Needed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Test 9 Number right = X 3 = Score**

---
TEST 10. RECOGNITION OF FAMILIAR MELODIES FROM NOTATION

DIRECTIONS: Below are phrases from ten songs that you know. Hum each to yourself and then write the name of the song or the words of the phrase on the line at the right. The sample is already marked as it should be.

SAMPLE.

Begin here.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10